

Technical Assistance Consultant's Report

Project Number: 46369

March 2013

Republic of the Union of Myanmar: Support for Education Sector Planning

(Cofinanced by the Government of Australia)

Prepared by Anthony Welch and Martin Hayden (in collaboration with the CESR Team, UNESCO national consultant, and CESR international advisers)

For Ministry of Education (MOE)

This consultant's report does not necessarily reflect the views of ADB or the Government concerned, and ADB and the Government cannot be held liable for its contents. (For project preparatory technical assistance: All the views expressed herein may not be incorporated into the proposed project's design.

Asian Development Bank









Myanmar Comprehensive Education Sector Review (CESR) **Phase 1: Rapid Assessment**

Technical Annex on the Higher Education Subsector

Final version (revised 26 March 2013)

Foreword

This report was prepared as part of the Rapid Assessment (Phase 1) of Myanmar's Comprehensive Education Sector Review (CESR), which is led by the Union of Myanmar Ministry of Education (MOE), coordinating inputs from other government agencies and support from an array of development partners. The report serves as a Technical Annex to the compilation "Volume 1" for CESR Phase 1. Under the umbrella of the CESR, the analysis reported herein was principally funded under Asian Development Bank (ADB) technical assistance—namely TA 7275-REG: Implementing the Greater Mekong Subregion Human Resource Development Strategic Framework and Action Plan, as well as TA 8187-MYA: Support for Education Sector Planning, cofinanced by ADB and the Government of Australia (represented by AusAID)—as well as support from the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).

Subject to more in-depth analysis under Phase 2 of the CESR, the report presents initial analysis of Myanmar's higher education subsector, based on various available data and information as well as efforts to consult with various stakeholders as part of the CESR's Rapid Assessment.

While the report was principally authored by (and reflects the views of) consultants Anthony Welch and Martin Hayden, it reflects a collaborative effort involving inputs from the CESR Team—including in particular Daw Tin Tin Shu, Daw Ohnmar Thein, Daw Honey Kyaw, and Daw Aye Aye Myint—throughout the process, Dr. Thet Lwin (national consultant by UNESCO), as well as CESR international advisers Ian Birch and Maurice Robson, all of whom contributed ideas and information about the higher education subsector in Myanmar.

This report draws on a Background Information Report on higher education prepared earlier during CESR Phase 1. It also reflects inputs from members of the ADB's staff team for Myanmar (particularly Yasushi Hirosato, with secondary inputs from Chris Spohr and Wolfgang Kubitzki), and of additional ADB-mobilized consultants supporting analyses of post-primary education subsectors under CESR Phase 1 (alphabetically, Paul Brady, Sideth Dy, Carsten Huttemeier, and Marion Young), as well as various counterparts from UNESCO, who jointly supported CESR Phase 1 analysis of higher education.

Finally, the report benefited from dialogue with counterparts from AusAID and UNICEF (which are supporting overall CESR coordination), as well as the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), and other development partners supporting the CESR.

Disclaimer:

The views expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the Government of Myanmar or any of its agencies; the Asian Development Bank (ADB) or its Board of Governors or the governments they represent; the Government of Australia; or UNESCO. ADB, AusAID, and UNESCO do not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this publication and accept no responsibility for any consequence of their use.

By making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area, or by using the term "country", this document does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acronyms	iv
Summary and Recommendations	v
A. Introduction	1
B. Overview of the Higher Education Subsector	1
C. Policy, Legislation and Management	12
D. Access and Equity	22
E. Quality and Relevance	29
F. Concluding Remarks	39
Appendix 1	41
Appendix 2	46

ACRONYMS

ADB Asian Development Bank

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CESR Comprehensive Education Sector Review
CUAB Council of University Academic Bodies

DEPT Department of Educational Planning and Training

GDP gross domestic product
HDI Human Development Index
HEI higher education institution
HES higher education subsector
HRD human resource development

ICT information and communication technology
IHLCS Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey
ISCED International Standard Classification of Education

JICA Japan International Cooperation Agency

KEI Knowledge Economy Index

MoD Ministry of Defence
MoE Ministry of Education
MoH Ministry of Health

MoL Ministry of Labour, Employment and Social Security

MoST Ministry of Science and Technology NEC National Education Committee

NCHRD National Centre for Human Resource Development

NSSA National Skills Standard Authority PRC People's Republic of China

TVET Technical and Vocational Education and Training

UIS UNESCO Institute for Statistics UCC Universities Central Council

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

After 50 years of relative isolation and neglect, the higher education subsector in Myanmar is in need of substantial renovation and re-investment. Not merely in buildings and equipment, much needed though that is, but also in capacity-building of teaching and administrative staff; of teaching and research quality. While data are incomplete, available measures comparing, for example, investment in education, research output, knowledge economy indices, and enrolment ratios, with ASEAN neighbours, underscore the need for a major re-commitment to higher education. As Myanmar opens up more and more, and as the service sector expands, this priority will only become more pressing, and the need for more high-skilled personnel increase. Given Myanmar's stated goal of approaching 'ASEAN standards' as a proximate goal for higher education, Myanmar's performance on several relevant measures are detailed throughout.

This situation occurs within the wider context of Myanmar's low rating on overall HDI, and transparency measures, relative to its ASEAN neighbours. Significant urban-rural differences also mark Myanmar society, restricting the participation and progress of significant numbers of its young people. While data are incomplete, it is clear that processes of differentiation begin much earlier than in the higher education subsector, and represent both an unacceptable brake on equity, and a significant loss of economic efficiency. In an era emphasising inclusive education, this must be addressed as a priority. More data is needed on relative public and private spending on higher education, in a context where private spending on education is troublingly high, while public expenditure on education remains relatively low. It is recommended therefore, that any move to raise existing fee levels be carefully modelled for equity impacts.

A major need identified is for a process of widespread community consultation leading to the development of a clear and coherent vision for the higher education subsector, that both reflects Myanmar's development goals, and gains the assent of major stakeholders, including not merely the state authorities and 13 relevant ministries, but also public and private HEIs. and representatives from the labour market. Current processes surrounding the development of a new Higher Education Law, (the first revision since 1973) and, separately, a Private Higher Education Law, may represent a chance to articulate and enshrine such a vision. This could include the awarding of some measure of academic and financial autonomy to (initially at least some) universities, which are currently under the control of 13 separate ministries. System coordination is identified as a clear need, as well as a clearer definition of higher education, and how it is differentiated from TVET, for example. The development of a national qualifications framework may help clarify such matters. The development of quality assurance measures, either through the creation of a national QA agency of some kind, (preferably independent of ministerial control), or by the injection of more resources and capacity into relevant ministries, is also highly recommended. This should encompass both public and private sector HEIs, as also HRD programmes.

Access and equity remain critical issues in the higher education subsector, and it is recommended that an Index of minimum quality be developed, embracing threshold teacher:student ratios, minimum proportions of academic staff with higher level qualifications, and facilities such as libraries and ICTs. Given the links between early school leaving and access to higher education indicated above, it is recommended that more systematic data be amassed on the links between early school leaving, (rural, ethnic, poverty) and differential H/Ed. access. A notable lack of systematic data on higher education access, by ethnicity, remains a barrier to the development of a more inclusive higher education system, and to rational planning outcomes and processes. Also on equity grounds, as well as efficiency, there is a need to work with taxation agencies and social welfare ministries and organisations, to develop the architecture to support a possible student loans schemes. The experience of

ASEAN neighbours counsels caution, and that a robust and transparent taxation system, accurate measures of total household income, as well as training of relevant personnel, would be minimum criteria. These are needed to ensure that any such scheme would not suffer from excessive default rates, would be efficient and transparent in the dispersal of limited resources, and would be equitable (so that loans go only to those who need them).

Swelling international interest in Myanmar, including programmes and projects to support the higher education system, represent both opportunities and challenges. Given ongoing stability and development, it is likely that such interest will only grow. It is therefore recommended that an overall matrix of all such offers be developed, and care taken both to avoid duplication, and ensure that they meet Myanmar's development goals. A 'single door' point of entry for all such projects and programmes is recommended.

Specific Recommendations are summarised within relevant sections of the report, including in matrixes within those sections.

THE HIGHER EDUCATION SUBSECTOR

A. Introduction

- 1. The Comprehensive Education Sector Review (CESR) is the first systematic education sector development project in Myanmar since the early 1990s. Under direction of the Ministry of Education (MoE), in consultation with other ministries, and with support from various international donor organisations, its purpose is to develop policies, legislation and plans for the education sector that utilise accurate and up-to-date information, that reflect the hopes and aspirations of the people of Myanmar, and that meet the development needs of the country.
- 2. The CESR has three phases, the first of which was a Rapid Assessment phase in which the emphasis lay on identifying urgent priorities and reform issues. This phase also sought to provide information about knowledge gaps. The second phase requires an indepth sector analysis that is large scale and participatory in approach, and that will incorporate more focused investigations and capacity building. The third phase will see the development of costed education sector plans.
- 3. This report addresses the higher education subsector and contributes to the Rapid Assessment phase by identifying urgent priorities and reform issues concerning: (a) policy, legislation and management; (b) access and equity; (c) finance, (d) international dimensions, and (d) quality and relevance. It also develops recommendations for areas requiring in-depth sector analysis during the CESR's second phase. Given Myanmar's explicit goal of using ASEAN standards as the proximate benchmark for lifting the quality of its higher education institutions and system in the next few years, reference is made throughout to Southeast Asian data, as appropriate.
- 4. The report begins with an overview of the higher education subsector that is informed by the limited documentation available, and by site visits and interviews. Obtaining approval for site visits was slow, and only a few were possible during the period of time available for completion of this report. Some formal and a larger number of informal interviews were conducted with individual members of academic staff, with small groups of students and with employer representatives, to supplement the site visits. A cluster study that would have provided much of the data needed for an in-depth discussion of issues of equity and financing was not available at the time of completing this report, and so discussion of these topics has had to rely on the limited information available.
- 5. The higher education subsector in Myanmar is defined as including all 164 higher education institutions (HEIs) listed in Appendix 1. There are, however, some definitional issues. One is that the institutions listed are far from homogeneous. While most have degree-conferring status, there are some that are quite restricted in terms of the number and size of degree-level programs conducted. Another is that many HEIs managed by the Ministry of Science and Technology (MoST) are also technical and vocational education and training (TVET) providers. The line of demarcation between higher education and TVET programs at these institutions is not always entirely clear.
- 6. A short questionnaire was developed for the purposes of collecting information from the HEIs listed in Appendix 1 a copy of the instrument is presented in Appendix 2. At the time of writing, only 46 of the 164 HEIs had responded to the questionnaire. The responses have not yet been analysed.

B. Overview of the Higher Education Subsector

- 7. National Setting. The Union of Myanmar, a British colony until 1948 and known as the Union of Burma until 1989, has a population of about 62 million. By 2020, its population will be 66 million, but the rate of population growth is slowing. Over one-quarter (26.6%) of its population is under the age of 15 years,² a feature with significant implications for future demand for educational provision.³ Its urban population now comprises one-third (33.7%) of the total and is increasing. Its economy remains heavily reliant on agriculture, which generates 36% of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and accounts for 60-70% of all employment, but infrastructure investment and the export of natural resources are becoming economically more important, and there has been strong recent growth in the services sector, which now accounts for about 37.6% of GDP. Economic growth over recent years has been strong – in 2010 it was an impressive 10.4%. GDP reached an estimated level of US\$51.9 billion in 2012, and GDP per capita, while still low, has increased sharply - up from US\$351 in 2008 to US\$857 in 2012. Thailand, India and People's Republic of China (PRC) are the top three export markets, while Thailand, the PRC and Singapore are the top three sources of imports. Economic sanctions imposed by the West are now progressively being lifted. Given ongoing openness and continuing political stability, strong economic growth seems likely to continue, with demand increasing in service sector areas such as tourism, banking / finance, and education. Manufacturing will also be an important growth sector for the economy, but possibly not for the longer term, when the demands of a modernising and expanding economy necessitate a vibrant and expanding services sector.⁵
- 8. Myanmar's Human Development Index (HDI) remains low in comparison with those of its Southeast Asian neighbours. Income distribution remains unequal, with significant disparities evident between rural and urban incomes, and geographically. A Gender Inequality Index (GEI) of 100 is higher than neighbouring ASEAN member states. Rates of poverty declined from 32.1% in 2005 to 25.6% in 2010 – but these figures do properly reflect the extent of the poverty gaps between rural and urban populations, ethnic groups, and combinations thereof. The UNDP's Human Development Report for 2011 showed over 23% of the population suffering multidimensional poverty, 13.4% of the population as being vulnerable to poverty, and 9.4% of the population as being vulnerable to extreme poverty. HDI scores, though up from 0.30 in 1990 to 0.48 in 2011, remain the lowest for Southeast Asia. Myanmar's global HDI rank is currently 149, of a total country count of 187. These circumstances impact directly on educational participation and progression.

Table 1. HDI, GEI and Gini Co-efficients, Myanmar and Selected ASEAN, 2011

Country	HDI Rating	Gender	Gini	Inequality	Inequality	% HDI Annual	% (aged 25+)
	(+ rank)	Inequality	Coefficient	Adjusted	Adjusted	Growth	with 2ndy. Ed.
		Index Rank		Ēďn.	HDI	2000-2011	F & (M)
Indonesia	.617 (124)	100	36.8	.465	.504	1.17	24.2 (31.1)
Malaysia	.761 (61)	43	46.2			0.69	66.0 (72.8)
Myanmar	.483 (149)	96				2.21	18.0 (17.6)
Philippines	.644 (112)	75	44.0	.592	.516	0.62	65.9 (63.7)
Thailand	.682 (103)	69	53.6	.490	.537	0.78	25.6 (33.7)
Viet Nam	.593 (128)	48	37.6	.417	1.06	1.06	24.7 (28.0)

Source: UNDP. HDI 20118

¹ In 2011 was only 1.3%. ADB. 2012. Key Indicators for Asia and the Pacific 2012. Myanmar. http://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/ki/2012/pdf/MYA.pdf

⁵ For a more detailed account of the state of economic and social development of Myanmar, see ADB. 2012. Myanmar 2012-14. Interim Country Partnership Strategy. See http://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/icps-mya-2012-2014.pdf

6 UNDP. 2012. Human Development Index 2011.

⁷ ADB. 2012. The Greater Mekong Region at 20. Progress and Prospects. Manila. p. 2.

² UN data, Country Profile, Myanmar. See http://data.un.org/CountryProfile.aspx?crName=MYANMAR

³ A. Welch. 2011. *Higher Education in South East Asia. Blurring Borders, Changing Balance*. London, Routledge. p. 11.

⁸ United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Human Development Index 2011 (Various Tables). The difference between the HDI and the Inequality-adjusted HDI (IHDI), (introduced in 2010) is that the latter is a

9. Transparency remains a major constraint on development and equity, with Myanmar listed among the countries with the lowest ratings on the Transparency International scale. With Afghanistan, and North Korea, Myanmar is rated among the weakest countries, with a rating of 180 among all listed countries, and an overall score of 1.5.9 President U Thein Sein has also acknowledged the problem openly, calling on state officials to end corrupt practices, including bribery. ¹⁰ Myanmar's rating compares poorly with key SE Asian neighbours, as seen in the following Table:

Table 2. Transparency/Corruption Ratings South East Asia, 2011

Country	Rank	Score
Indonesia	100	3.0
Malaysia	60	4.3
Myanmar	180	1.5
Philippines	129	2.6
Thailand	80	3.4
Viet Nam	112	2.9

Source: Corruption Perceptions Index, 2011¹¹

- 10. A distinctive feature of Myanmar is its ethnic diversity. It is widely reported that there are as many as 135 distinct ethnic groups in Myanmar. Of these, Burmans account for 68% of the population. They are found mainly in the seven lowland regions of Ayeyarwady, Bago, Magway, Mandalay, Sagaing, Tanintharyi and Yangon. Other significant ethnic nationalities include the Shan (9%), Karen (7%), Rakhine (4%), Chinese (3%), Indian (2%) and Mon (2%). They live mainly in the seven upland states of Chin, Kachin, Kayah, Kayin, Mon, Rakhine and Shan. Burman dominance has been an ongoing source of political tension in Myanmar, the consequences of which have been seen in intermittent periods of civil conflict.
- 11. **Higher Education Context**. During the 1950s and 1960s, Burma (now Myanmar) was reputed to have an advanced education system by the standards of the time. Its two universities, one in Rangoon (now Yangon) and the other in Mandalay, enjoyed reputations for being among the best in the East Asian region. Since then, Myanmar's education system has fallen into disrepair, largely but not entirely because of an ongoing lack of public funds. Its higher education system has suffered the effects meagre budgets over a prolonged period of time. In addition, there has been strong State intervention in the higher education system due to universities and technical institutes, particularly in the larger cities, being perceived as sources of political opposition. Only during the past few years has public funding of the education system shown any sign of significant improvement. In 2012-13, the proportion of

measure that accounts for inequality. Thus, under perfect equality, the IHDI is equal to the HDI, but falls below the HDI when inequality rises. In this sense, the IHDI is the actual level of human development (taking into account inequality), while the HDI is an index of the potential human development that could be achieved if there were no inequality. The IHDI accounts for inequality in HDI dimensions by "discounting" each dimension's average value according to its level of inequality.

Myanmar President Office, (2012) President U Thein Sein delivers an Address at the Meeting on Reform to Improve Management and Administrative Capacity of the Government', http://www.president-office.gov.mm/en/briefing-room/speeches-and-remarks/2012/12/26/id-1320
While the empirical base of the index has been criticised at times, it is widely seen as one of the better

"While the empirical base of the index has been criticised at times, it is widely seen as one of the better measures of transparency. A score of 10 indicates a complete absence of corruption, while a score of 0 indicates complete corruption. The index draws on varied "assessments and business opinion surveys carried out by independent and reputable institutions. The surveys and assessments used to compile the index include questions relating to the bribery of public officials, kickbacks in public procurement, embezzlement of public funds, and questions that probe the strength and effectiveness of public-sector anti-corruption efforts." The only other countries with comparable rankings (of 180 or lower and with a score of 1.5 or less) are Afghanistan, North Korea and Somalia. Singapore's outlier status in SE Asia is confirmed in the fact that it consistently tops regional transparency rates.

² Science. 2012. Raising Up a Fallen Ivory Tower. 30 November. See www.sciencemag.org

•

Transparency International (2011) http://www.transparency.org/cpi2011/results/

the State budget allocated to education is planned to rise to 6.26% (up from 3.74% in the previous financial year), equating to around 1.4 to 1.5% of GDP (up from 0.69% in the previous financial year). Even with this growth, however, funding levels will fall well short of regional benchmarks – in Viet Nam, for example, the proportion of the State budget allocated to education will be almost four times higher.

- 12. Student dropout is a major issue for the education system. Only 40% of young people remain in school to complete Year 9, 14 and only 77% of children progress from the primary to the secondary stages of schooling compared with 92% for Indonesia and 99% for the Philippines. 15 The gross enrolment ratio for secondary education is about 56%, which compares poorly with Indonesia and Viet Nam, both at 77%. 16 As discussed further below, only about 11% young people succeed in reaching higher education.
- 13. The quality of teaching and learning is a major issue. In general, it is quite poor, with 'parrot' (or rote) learning being common at nearly all levels. Resources for learning are also completely inadequate books, journals, computers and IT access are either severely constricted or not available at all, particularly in rural areas. The textbooks available are mostly out-dated. Teacher-student ratios are high by international standards. Salaries for teachers in schools and for lecturers in universities and colleges, the large majority of whom are female, are unattractive (See Table and discussion below).
- 14. The history of Myanmar's higher education system is important to understand, as a basis for appreciating the present situation. In 1878, Rangoon College was established as an affiliated college of the University of Calcutta. In 1904, it became Government College, and in 1920, it became University College. In 1920, it and a Baptist-affiliated college, Judson College, were amalgamated to form Rangoon University. 19 Mandalay College was added in 1925; a Teachers Training College and a Medical College were added in 1930; and an Agriculture College in Mandalay was added in 1938. In 1949, the year after national independence, the Government re-established Rangoon University by turning its relatively autonomous colleges into faculties of the University. In 1959, the University of Mandalay was established as a separate university, with its own system of affiliated colleges. A significant turning point occurred in 1963 when, following a military coup the previous year and the adoption of General Ne Win's Burmese Way to Socialism, Rangoon and Mandalay Universities were placed directly under State control. In 1964, they had their professional faculties in education, economics, medicine, and so on, removed and given independent degree-conferring status as profession-specific technical institutes. Rangoon and Mandalay Universities were left to deliver programs in the liberal arts, science and law. A *University* Education Law of 1973 further codified the situation: universities were defined as comprising either arts and science universities (Rangoon University and Mandalay University) or technical institutes developed from the former profession-specific faculties of Rangoon and Mandalay Universities. Universities and technical institutes were given permission to confer degrees, and were placed under management by the MoE, but with the State reserving the right to permit other ministries to establish universities.

¹⁶ Ibid., Table 6, p. 115.

¹⁸ A distinctive feature of the system is its high reliance on females as teachers – for example, over 80% of upper secondary teachers are female, which is quite likely the highest such proportion in the world.
¹⁹ A figure of 1:34 was reported by U Saw Gibson and U Thein Htay. 1992. Organization and Management of

_

¹³ ADB. 2012. *Initial Assessment of Post Primary Education in Myanmar*. Manila. p. 27. ASEAN figures for 2001 show Education as comprising only 0.5% of GDP, See Than, M., (2005). *Myanmar in ASEAN. Regional Cooperation Experience*. Singapore, ISEAS. p. 6, Table 1.2.

¹⁴ UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS), Fig 18, p. 39.

¹⁵ Ibid., Table 3, p. 100.

¹⁷ Ibid., Table 7, p. 119.

¹⁹ A figure of 1:34 was reported by U Saw Gibson and Ū Thein Htay. 1992. *Organization and Management of Universities and Colleges*. Myanmar Education Research Bureau Working Paper Series No. 6.3. More recent rates are not known but are unlikely to have improved.

- 15. Other significant developments since then include the following. In 1976, the MoE initiated a university correspondence program as a financially self-reliant initiative - this program subsequently provided the basis for the National Centre for Human Resource Development (NCHRD), established in 1998. In 1982, English was re-introduced as the medium of instruction in universities - having been replaced in 1962 by Burmese. In 1981, Rangoon University became Yangon University, following a change in the official name of the city of Rangoon. During the late 1980s and the 1990s, universities were closed for extended periods following student protests against the military leadership of the country – in Yangon, for example, universities were closed for 10 of the 12 years from 1988 to 2000. During the late 1990s, against a backdrop of official concern about student protests, the Government approved the establishment of a large number of new HEIs belonging to a wide range of ministries. These new institutions were often located well away from large urban centres, thus making it less likely that students might engage in significant political protest. The Government also removed the right of Yangon and Mandalay Universities to offer undergraduate programs – a decision that seems guite recently to have been reversed.
- Notwithstanding widespread popular enthusiasm for rebuilding the higher education system, many challenges remain. As with the education system in general, resources for teaching and learning, including books, libraries and specialised teaching spaces such as laboratories are limited and are often either out-dated or obsolete. It has been difficult to maintain newer infrastructure and equipment, such as spectrometers and electron microscopes.²⁰ The World Bank's most recent Knowledge Economy Index (KEI) ranked Myanmar almost last of 145 countries surveyed. 21 Graduate unemployment, underemployment and migration, often associated with a mismatch between degree programs and the demands of a modernising labour market, are further signs of a poorly aligned higher education system.²² Research is an optional extra, rather than an expectation.²³ A further constraint is the legacy of a command and control system of centralised administration at the ministry and institutional level. The legacy has contributed to a culture of obeisance to higher authority. According to the British Council: "The Burmese tertiary education system is underdeveloped and inefficient. Legislation regarding quality and standards, as well as investment in education is lacking. After graduation, many students have problems finding jobs in part due to the lack of qualification, even within Burma."24
- Current plans include the redevelopment of a small number of higher education 17. institutions into centres of excellence, and there is talk that an as-yet-unnamed United States philanthropist may support the redevelopment of Yangon University. Already, Yangon Technological University and Mandalay Technological University have re-admitted undergraduates, and it is expected that undergraduates will be re-admitted to Yangon University in 2013.
- Structure, Governance and Management. The structure of the higher education subsector remains largely as prescribed by the University Education Law of 1973, but the number of HEIs has increased markedly since 1973 and the nature of the institutions now comprising the subsector has become more complex. Whereas in 1974, the MoE was solely responsible for all universities and institutes, by 2012 there were 13 ministries with

World Bank.

British Council. 2012. Education Overview. Burma. London.

²⁰ Science. 2012. p. 1141.

^{2012.} Knowledge (KEI) Rankings. Economy Index 2012 See http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTUNIKAM/Resources/2012.pdf The KEI is a composite index, based on the following pillars of the knowledge economy: economic incentive and institutional regime (EIR); innovation and technological adaptation; education and training; information and communications technologies (ICT) infrastructure.

²² University World News. 2012. Degrees 'not worth the paper they're written on. 19 August.

²³ Examples were given of a medical HEI in which there was no funding available for research: "Any research projects must be financed by students themselves, from their own salaries."

management responsibilities. The MoE remains the dominant ministry – its 66 HEIs account for 77% of all higher education enrolments; but the MoST now manages as many as 61 universities, technological institutes and computer universities, accounting for 18% of all higher education enrolments, and two other important ministries, the Ministry of Health (MoH) and the Ministry of Defence (MoD), manage 15 and 5 HEIs, respectively. Nearly all HEIs, other than the liberal arts and science universities and colleges, are highly specialised, whether in economics, teacher education, foreign languages, engineering, computer studies, maritime studies, defence, agriculture, forestry, medicine, nursing, veterinary science, fine arts, or some other field.

- 19. The *University Education Law* of 1973, which provides the legislative foundation for the higher education system, established a centralised framework of governance within which a range of matters traditionally decided by universities themselves became matters for decision by either a Universities Central Council (UCC) or a Council of University Academic Boards (CUAB). Responsibilities assigned to the UCC were: (a) to provide the guiding principles for higher education; (b) to make recommendations to the Government for the establishment of new universities, colleges and institutes; (c) to determine degrees, diplomas and certificates that universities may confer; (d) to set enrolment quotas commensurate with staffing provisions; (e) to identify and prescribe research projects that are beneficial to the country; (f) to prescribe academic staff qualification requirements; and (g) to supervise institutional management bodies. The Minister for Education was given responsibility for chairing this Council, which was to be comprised of deputy-ministers from a wide range of ministries, director-generals of various government departments, rectors of universities, principals of colleges and institutes, and various other appointees representing political and community interests. In 2012, the Council had a membership of 42 persons.
- 20. The Law determined that a subsidiary body, the CUAB, also chaired by the Minister for Education, and with much the same membership as the UCC, should assume responsibility for university standards, the qualifications framework and the student selection system. The CUAB was also expected to: (a) review and supervise systems of instruction in universities; (b) prescribe rules and regulations for the conduct of university examinations; (c) determine the academic qualifications required by members of academic staff for different levels of appointment; (d) coordinate research activities and functions across the university system; and (e) examine and make recommendations on university advancement projects submitted by individual universities. In 2012, this Council had a membership of 55 persons.
- 21. The two Councils met on successive days in March 2012. It is not evident that they have a regular schedule of meetings. Reports suggest that the previous occasion on which they met was in 2007.
- 22. Recently, in April 2011, a National Education Committee (NEC) (formerly the Myanmar Education Committee, established in 1991) was formed, with responsibility for national coordination of the education system, including the higher education subsector. The Minister for Education chairs the NEC, the membership of which includes the deputy ministers of each of the ministries and agencies responsible for administering education institutions. Its main functions are to: (a) advise on the development of legislation; (b) coordinate the adoption of national policies; (c) provide guidance on the implementation of training programs, and coordinate the review and amendment of training programs; (d) guide cooperation with international development agencies and educational organizations in implementing training programs; (e) coordinate the implementation of Myanmar's 30-year Long-term Education Development Plan; and (f) develop policies for the purposes of raising the quality of training programs to international standards. The Committee held its first meeting in March 2012.

- 23. The University Education Law of 1973 prescribed that universities and institutes should have their own management and academic committee. The management committee was to be chaired by the rector and was required to include two members nominated by the relevant line-management ministry, two members of the UCC, three faculty members and the institution's registrar. Its duties were to: (a) transact financial business; (b) prescribe and enforce student discipline requirements; (c) perform business related to the campus; (d) supervise the sporting, physical education and cultural activities of the students; (e) manage facilities for the health of university students and employees; (f) manage business connected with hostels; and (g) select students, other than those in their first year of studies, for stipends or free tuition. The academic committee, also chaired by the rector, was to include the deans of faculties, the professors, the heads of departments, external experts in particular subject areas, the principals of any affiliated institutes or colleges, and the university registrar (as secretary). Its duties were to: (a) recommend on teaching subjects for the university; (b) review the syllabus for training programs and recommend them for approval by the CUAB; (c) hold examinations and announce results; (d) award degrees, diplomas, certificates and prizes; (e) examine and prescribe university textbooks; and (f) make recommendations, in consultation with the teaching staff, for the introduction of postgraduate courses.
- 24. The *University Education Law* of 1973 explicitly deprived HEIs of financial autonomy. As with other State instrumentalities, they were required to have their budget estimates approved by the State, to deposit all receipts of funds in prescribed State accounts, and to ensure that all expenditures were consistent with State-approved norms.
- 25. Within the different ministries responsible for HEIs, different types of administrative structures have evolved. In the MoE, for instance, there are two Departments of Higher Education, one for Upper Myanmar and one for Lower Myanmar, each having separate responsibility for administering and coordinating the work of a total of 46 of the 66 HEIs managed by the MoE. These institutions include 38 arts and science universities, colleges and degree colleges, together with various institutes of education, economics, languages and journalism. Another department within the MoE, the Department of Educational Planning and Training (DEPT), has responsibility for administering 21 Education Colleges.
- 26. **Academic Staff and Students**. In 2012, there were 10,960 members of academic staff.²⁵ Of these, 783 (7%) were professors and another 767 (7%) were associate professors. All personnel employed by HEIs are civil servants and, as such, are subject to State regulations regarding their appointment, promotion, termination of service, remuneration, disciplinary action, leave and privileges, and so on. Responsibility for appointing rectors rests with the Government. Rectors usually have responsibility for the appointment of academic and administrative staff members. Members of academic staff are subject to transfer from institution to institution every two years for the purposes of rotating academic them between HEIs across the country. Qualifications affect initial academic appointment levels, and then seniority prevails in the matter of securing promotions. In 2012, a remarkably large proportion (82.6%) of all members of academic staff were female.
- 27. Students who matriculate from secondary school may apply for admission to enter a HEI. Students coming directly from school are considered for regular programs, while those who completed the matriculation process in previous years are considered only for distance education programs. This distinction is important in terms of its implications. Only about one-third of all students sitting the matriculation examination (known also as the basic education high school examination) achieve a pass grade, and so those repeating the

2

²⁵ Caution must routinely be exercised when reporting and interpreting numerical data about staff and student numbers in Myanmar. There are numerous instances of contradictory sets of figures. Some collections refer to the MoE only, while others refer to the whole of the higher education subsector.

examination are excluded from admission to regular programs at HEIs. Marks obtained in the matriculation examination determine admission to higher education, and applicants with the best marks are the most able to access more highly preferred higher education courses. A form of positive discrimination is practised for male students completing the matriculation examination – their pass level is set slightly below the pass level expected for girls, thereby providing boys with better opportunity to obtain a pass grade. Nonetheless, girls still generally out-perform boys, and are more likely to proceed to higher education studies. For some higher education programs, additional gender-based ratios may apply to admissions, and for training programs managed by the MoD there are additional selection tests.

- 28. The matriculation examination allows for students to complete one of seven combinations of six subjects each. The subjects include Myanmar Language, English and Mathematics, which are compulsory across all seven combinations, and Physics, Chemistry, History, Economics, Zoology, Geography and Optional Myanmar Language. The most popular options are those involving Mathematics, Physics and Chemistry. Access to many preferred profession-specific higher education courses requires this combination of subjects to have been successfully completed in the matriculation examination.
- 29. In May 2012, there were 470,912 higher education students in Myanmar.²⁶ Most (60.3%) were enrolled as distance education students affordability, convenience and failure to have been admitted to regular programs are reasons for the size of the enrolment numbers in these programs. Graduates from these programs have more limited employment opportunities, however. They may not, for example, be able to access sought-after positions as State employees.
- 30. Of 186,668 students enrolled in regular programs, 174,771 were undergraduates. The average enrolment of regular students across all HEIs was only 1,145 students there are marked variations in enrolment numbers between HEIs, with some HEIs having very few higher education students enrolled in regular programs. In 2011-12, the lecturer-to-student ratio was estimated to be 1:43 in MoE institutions, 1:74 in MoST institutions, and 1:31 across the higher education system as a whole. HEIs in more remote parts of the country generally have better lecturer-to-student ratios these institutions are also often under management by ministries other than the MoE or the MoST.
- 31. In 2012, there were eight universities permitted to award doctorates (Yangon University, Mandalay University, Yangon Institute of Economics, Yangon Institute of Education, Mawlamyine University, Monywa Institute of Economics, Meiktila Institute of Economics, and Yangon University of Foreign Languages). About 2,000 candidates were enrolled in PhD programs across these eight institutions but this figure may not be entirely reliable. Possibly as many as one-half of these candidates were enrolled at the University of Yangon.
- 32. A striking feature of the higher education subsector in Myanmar is the extent of the gender imbalance in 2012, 60% of all higher education students and 82.6% of all academic staff members were female. The reasons for this situation have not been systematically investigated the most likely contributing factors are that boys are more able to find employment at an earlier age than girls, and that girls are more likely to pursue a career as a teacher, and hence must continue their studies at a HEI. Cultural traditions have also been pointed to. Some HEIs are attended exclusively, or mainly, by males only males can attend Ministry of Defence universities and colleges, for example, and boys are much more likely to undertake studies in universities and colleges specialising in the delivery of programs in forestry and engineering.

_

²⁶ Some estimates, however, are as high as 600,000 students.

- 33. According to a preliminary analysis of data from the Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey (IHLCS) in Myanmar in 2009-10, the net enrolment rate of young people aged 18-21 in higher education was 10.6%, but with some marked disparities between different groups of young people. Among urban households, almost 30% of 18 and 19 year-olds were enrolled in higher education, compared with about 9% for rural households, and less than 5% for poor rural households.²⁷
- 34. **Planning Framework.** The 30-Year Long-Term Education Development Plan, commencing in 2000-01, provides the main planning framework for the higher education subsector. The Plan entails implementation of 36 action programs, across six priority areas. The priority areas are: human resource development, the utilisation of technology, the expansion of research, the development of lifelong learning, the promotion of quality, and the preservation of national identity and national values.
- 35. Recently, in September 2012, a National Development Plan for higher education identified 13 specific priorities for the higher education subsector: (a) to reorganise and extend the number of faculties in MoE universities; (b) to develop a QA system; (c) to reform the current university admission system; (d) to develop TVET courses for delivery as human resource development (HRD) programs offered by universities; (e) to improve the quality of administrative officials, teachers and laboratory technicians; (f) to improve the quality of students; (g) to develop a law for private higher education; (h) to promote the quality of education up to an international level; (i) to create a vibrant academic community at universities; (j) to expand networks between Myanmar and international universities; (k) to upgrade English language teaching; (l) to improve the instruction of international relations, law and economics; and (m) to encourage exceptional talent by providing scholarships across the arts and sciences. The vision underpinning these priorities was of a higher education system comparable with higher education systems in other Association of Southeast Asian Nation (ASEAN) countries.
- 36. Planning for the higher education subsector is supported by a series of annual seminars for rectors and equivalent-level persons. Over the years, these seminars have addressed many topics, including the "relevancy and responsiveness of existing courses, redesigning of course structure, reform of the assessment system, introduction of faculty development programmes, harnessing of information and communication technologies (ICT) in higher education, enhancement of cooperation with foreign institutions, creation of an alternative delivery modality for higher education, and the introduction of new programmes to promote human resources development". ²⁸ The seminars have focused particularly on implementing the 30-Year Long-term Education Development Plan in the context of the higher education subsector. In May 2012, for example, the annual seminar addressed action programs from the Plan relating to issues of student quality, teacher quality, applied research, international collaboration, scholarship programs and administrative systems. The annual seminar in May 2012 also addressed the development of a feasible QA system to enable HEIs to meet international standards.
- 37. **Curriculum and Assessment.** In a paper completed by Dr Khin Saw Naing in 1992, student assessment was concisely defined as "any systematic appraisal of student performance using scientific criteria and measurements" its main purpose being to help students "to identify: (1) how much they have learnt and (2) how much they have yet to learn, in contrast to the secondary task of certifying that they have learnt enough".²⁹ In Myanmar's

3. ²⁹ Khin Saw Naing, 1992. *Student Evaluation*. Working Paper No. 2.4. Ministry of Education/UNDP/UNESCO, Myanmar Education Research Bureau, Yangon, February. p.1.

 ²⁷ C. Spohr. 2012. *Informal Note on IHLCS Household Survey Analysis as an Input to the CESR*. para. 46.
 ²⁸ Department of Higher Education (Lower Myanmar). 2012. *Panorama of Myanmar Higher Education*. Yangon. p.

schools, student assessment tends to focus mainly on what Dr Khin Saw Naing described as its secondary task, that is, of certifying that students have learnt enough. Examinations exercise a pervasive and dominating influence of the culture of schools in Myanmar, and they also strongly affect the culture of the higher education subsector. They are utilised not only to determine that students have met the prescribed syllabus requirements but also as a basis for appraising the performance of lecturers. Their impact can be perverse, as when students resort to cheating in order to secure passing grades, and as when lecturers cram their students with the knowledge required to secure a pass so that the lecturers themselves do not become subject to criticism by their superiors.

- 38. As is common across many Southeast Asian higher education systems, there is a heavy reliance by higher education students on 'extra study' classes, that is, classes conducted during the evening or at weekends for the purposes of providing students with additional opportunities to learn. These classes may be relatively expensive to attend, and are often conducted by the same lecturers who teach in regular programs during the day. Curiously, students appear to enjoy these classes more than their day classes.³⁰
- 39. **Quality Assurance**. There are no formal mechanisms for determining the extent to which HEIs in Myanmar meet the expectations of their students, staff, stakeholders and the society. Legislation regarding the quality and academic standards of the higher education subsector has never been approved. Though Myanmar is a member of the Asia-Pacific Quality network, the ASEAN Quality Assurance Network, University Mobility in Asia and the Pacific, the ASEAN University Network, the Association of Southeast Asian Institutions of Higher Learning, and the Association of Pacific Rim Universities, it is at a very elementary stage in terms of developing a quality assurance system. The lack of institutional autonomy and the slowness of centralised decision-making are regarded as being significant impediments.³¹
- 40. **Research**. After decades of neglect, a culture of research needs to be rebuilt. The following table that charts innovation indices in SE Asia, shows the output and growth of both papers and citations in Myanmar since the millenium, relative to the performance of neighbouring ASEAN member states.

Country No. of % Increase Nos. of % Citations Impact **Papers** 2000-2011 Relative to Citations Increase per Paper, 2000-2011 2000-2011 2000-2005 2000-2011 World Indonesia 8,240 255.16 68,081 -12.37 8.26 0.73 Malaysia 31,814 878.20 139,890 16.60 4.40 0.39 **Philippines** 7,130 240.10 65,355 -5.55 9.17 0.81 Thailand 38,500 463.99 307,161 201.88 7.98 0.70 Viet Nam 5,207 421.43 31,959 137.03 6.14 0.65 272.22 Myanmar 425 3,644 176.10 8.57 0.76

Table 3. Papers and Citations, by Country, 2000-2011

(Thomson Reuters InCites), Welch 2013.

Note: since they take time to accumulate, citations were measured 2000-2005.

The data can be seen as reflecting the effects of prolonged isolation, in that the quantitative total of papers and citations is very low, even in relation to neighbouring ASEAN. At the same time, however, there are more hopeful signs, notably that the proportional increase of papers and citations (2000-2010, and 2000-2005 respectively), is substantial. Equally, the data

³⁰ There is no systematically body of evidence to support this claim, but the comment is widely made and has never been disputed by any past or current students and lecturers interviewed in the course of preparing this report.

³¹S. Pitiyanuwat. 2011. Quality Assurance in South-East Asian Higher Education. In C. Brock and L. Pe Symaco, eds. *Education in South-East Asia*. Oxford, UK: Symposium Books.

regarding the quality of research, as reflected in the final two columns of the above table, is broadly comparable with neighbouring ASEAN. Lastly, of the few proposals submitted, success at EU SEA grant applications is substantially higher than the average.³² Effectively, the data in Table 4 show that the research furrow, while very thin, is not shallow. The problem is at least as much quantitative as qualitative. See also below on INTERNATIONAL for international support for research. (See also Recommendations, below re. national research scheme)

- Research projects are individually approved at an institutional level, and noted by the relevant ministry. Interviews suggested that research students are expected to pay for their research projects 'out of their own pocket'. To a very large extent, research projects have been confined to areas of science and technology, but this situation is changing as international collaboration allows for the opening up of research projects in non-science areas. A significant constraint on research in scientific and technological fields is limited infrastructure. The MoE has indicated a long-term plan to establish HEIs specialising in research, and to support collaborative research with international research centres and organisations. Centres of research excellence are being established within a small number of universities, 33 but recent reports suggest that these centres are also being given an independent status as HEIs, rather than being required to augment the research culture of the universities with which they are associated.
- 42. Finance. In 2011-12, only 4.8% of the Government budget was allocated to education – a remarkably low percentage, compared with, say, Viet Nam, where almost 20% of the Government budget is allocated to education. In 2011-12, the proportion of GDP spent by the Government on the field of education was 0.78% - again, a very small proportion compared with levels across other countries in the region. For 2012-13, the share of Government budget allocated to education is projected to increase to 5.08%, when it will account for 1.43% of GDP.34 Overall, World Bank data shows an alarming 70% of total spending on education is by households - more than 3 times the rate in neighbouring Laos, and almost 4 times the global average. 35 Equivalent data for higher education is, as yet, unavailable (see Recommendations, below).
- The public budget for higher education is predominantly (78.3%) allocated to recurrent expenditure, on salaries mainly. Even so, salaries for university and college lecturers are widely considered to be inadequate in that they are not sufficient to enable one parent to support a family - hence, together with cultural factors, the reluctance of many males to seek to become lecturers. There are also few financial incentives to support quality teaching in universities, and funds for the maintenance and improvement of buildings are extremely limited. Student tuition fee levels are guite low, compared with the needs of the system. In 2009-10, the unit cost for 'regular' university students was estimated to be 112,636 kyats (US\$131.97) per annum, and only 43,481 kyats (US\$50.82) per annum when distance education students were also included. 36 By standards across the Southeast Asian region, these levels are very low. As indicated above, funds for research are absent (See Recommendations, below)
- 44. The MoE and certain other ministries (but not the MoST) permit HEIs to generate additional fee income through the provision of HRD programs. These programs are delivered through the NCHRD and the institutions concerned may keep the income they earn to pay staff salaries. Approximately 195 training programs (mainly certificate-level, but also

³² European Union, (EU). SEA EU. Country Profile. MM – Myanmar (Third Countries group). http://www.seaeu.net/attach/MM Country Profiles 20120727.pdf

33 To date, there may be four of them.

³⁴ JICA. 2012. *Data Collection Survey on Education Sector in Myanmar*. Draft Interim Report, Table 2.4.

 $^{^{35}}$ Ibid. p.7. ³⁶ Footnote 30, Table 2.5.

programs up master-degree level) were delivered through HRD Centres in 2012, compared with a total of 215 regular academic programs offered at first-degree, Honours, diploma, master's degree and doctoral levels through universities and colleges. HRD programs do not (except at master's level) require any admission examinations. No data was available as to how much income is generated, or how, and for what purposes it was dispersed.

- 45. **Private Higher Education.** A significant bifurcation exists between private HEIs and public sector institutions. Private HEIs are entirely dependent on fees, (some set at around US\$300 per month, which compared to GDP per capita of around US\$850 per annum, effectively excludes all but the wealthiest). There are no legally recognised private HEIs in Myanmar. Some private institutions offer foundation programs for higher education studies, but their status as higher education providers is unclear and they are not regulated by the State. Some private HEIs advertise that graduation after 2 years confers a UK Higher National Diploma (HND), operated by the UK Examinations authority Edexcel. (The UK qualification is roughly equivalent to the first two years of a 3 year degree level study, or to the Diploma of Higher Education). Legislation for the creation of a private higher education sector is currently under development.
- 46. **Teacher Training.** In 1998, five Teacher Training Colleges and 14 Teacher Training Schools were upgraded to the level of Education Colleges, offering in-service training courses for primary and lower-secondary level teachers, and pre-service training mainly in the form of a two-year Diploma in Teacher Education program. In addition, there are two Institutes of Education, one in Yangon (established in 1964) and one in Sagain (established in 1992), that provide Bachelor of Education programs, as well as postgraduate diplomas, master degrees and PhDs in Education. Yangon Institute of Education, for example, provides PhD programs in methodology, educational theory and educational psychology.

C. Policy, Legislation and Management

47. This section addresses urgent priorities and reform issues that relate to policy, legislation and management for the higher education subsector. It also develops recommendations for areas requiring in-depth sector analysis during the CESR's second phase. Table 1 presents an overview of the contents of this section.

Table 4: Policy, Legislation and Management Recommendations: Overview

Priority Areas	Issues	Recommendations			
An enduring vision	There is not yet a unifying statement of principles to guide the future direction of development of the higher education subsector.	Institute a capacity-building program to build consensus around an enduring vision statement for the higher education subsector. Promote discussion about the implications for the subsector of the adoption of a unifying statement of principles.			
Coordination and planning	Structures, such as NEC, UCC and CUAB, possibly exist for coordinating the higher education subsector exist, but their effectiveness is not known, nor it is clear if all ministries are obliged to comply with their decisions. Planning for the subsector takes place (for example, the 30-year Long-Term Education Development Plan, and the more recent National Education Development Plan), but have accountabilities and timelines been assigned for the attainment of specific goals and objectives? Nor is it clear if all ministries are obliged to conform to these plans.	Evaluate the effectiveness of the main national coordinating and planning bodies (especially the NEC and the UCC) in achieving national priorities for the higher education subsector, make policy recommendations as appropriate. Provide capacity-building support for the development of plans for the higher education subsector – including a Secretariat to service any national coordinating bodies. Set detailed agendas, regular meetings, explicit targets, with associated accountabilities across all ministries responsible for HEIs and with clear timelines for			
Structure	The higher education subsector is	Implement a capacity-building program to			

	structurally fragmented, with different ministries having different conceptions of the nature of a university, different curriculum and syllabus requirements, different quality standards, and different employment conditions for academic staff members. There is no agreed national qualifications framework, and so HEIs are not well placed to achieve international recognition.	facilitate the adoption of a national qualifications framework, such as UNESCO's ISCED, that differentiates in ways that are internationally recognised between degree-level and other qualification levels. Facilitate an appraisal of all degree-conferring HEIs and all degree programs in light of an internationally accepted qualifications framework. Develop an options paper that addresses the viability of having one ministry only responsible for the higher education subsector.
Governance and management	Governance of the higher education subsector tends to be centralised, with levels of institutional autonomy afforded to HEIs being quite limited. HEIs themselves are also centrally managed, and rectors, once appointed, may have long periods of tenure in office regardless of their effectiveness.	Develop an options paper for detailed consideration by the NEC and UCC re. governance and management models for the higher education subsector, drawing upon international trends in higher education governance and management, and addressing specific issues related to a phase-in of the granting of institutional autonomy for HEIs and the establishment of transparent criteria for the selection and performance-review of rectors. Institute pilot project to phase in institutional and financial autonomy at some of the strongest HEIs; support this project via adequate staff training, and adequate staff development of both institutional leaders and ministry/agency officials, linked to QA and transparency measures. Feedback from pilot project to be incorporated into any extension of autonomy to further HEIs.
Finance and private-sector investment	There is a lack of systematic financial data about the higher education subsector. There is no information available about either the total amount of expenditure on higher education, or on expenditure in this area compared to expenditures on other areas of State responsibility. The extent of private expenditure on higher education is not known. Options for increasing private expenditure (for example, through fee increases, or the creation of a private sector of higher education) have not been costed. Regarding private-sector investments, there is no existing legislative or policy framework.	Provide capacity-building support to develop a comprehensive financial database on higher education subsector, and subsequently for the analysis of the data, including modelling of the financial impact of measures such as raising student tuition fees and introducing a private higher education sector. The social impact of such measures, particularly concerning equity, should be carefully modelled. Collect data on public v private spending on higher education. Examine implications of Foreign Investment Law (2012), and any other relevant laws, for impact on the operation of foreign branch campus projects. Collect HEI data on HRD income, and how it is dispersed. Model costs and benefits of moderate raise in academic salaries, to lessen pressure to 'moonlight'.
Quality assurance	There is no national quality assurance system for the higher education subsector. Current discussion of quality assurance methods is not well informed by international standards of best practice.	Provide capacity-building support for the development of an affordable and realistic quality assurance model for the higher education subsector – that embraces public and private sector HEIs, and HRD programmes. Take account of regional QA agencies and standards in higher education such as the BAN-PT in Indonesia). Develop performance indicators for possible adoption by the higher education subsector. Investigate option of an independent national accreditation agency. Train officials in QA procedures, linked to transparency training.

48. **An Enduring Vision.** While various policy and planning documents in Myanmar identify goals, action programs and priority areas for the higher education subsector, there is no clear long-term vision. The National Education Development Plan approved in September 2012 states a short-term vision as follows: "to upgrade the education standard to the standard of ASEAN universities and produce highly qualified human resources for ... society".

This vision is limited in terms of its usefulness. Not only is it very general in terms of what it proposes, but it also seems to falsely assume a single ASEAN standard for HEIs. In practice, standards vary enormously, both within and between ASEAN countries.

- 49. A more enduring vision statement for the subsector is one that might take into account the importance of principles such as: (a) quality that the higher education subsector will provide students with a stimulating and rewarding educational experience, and that it will play a pivotal role in national research and innovation; (b) efficiency that the higher education subsector will make the most productive use of its finite financial and human resources; (c) unity that all elements in the higher education subsector will work cooperatively and harmoniously in the pursuit of a common set of educational goals; (d) equity that the higher education subsector will provide opportunities for all capable people to participate to their full potential in higher education, and that the subsector will strive to provide a continuum of high-quality learning opportunities throughout an individual's life; and (e) internationalization that the higher education subsector will promote student and staff mobility and the exchange of knowledge and ideas, and that its performance will routinely be benchmarked against models of best practice, initially from elsewhere in the Southeast Asian region, and ultimately globally.³⁷
- 50. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be a capacity-building program aimed at building consensus around an enduring vision statement for the higher education subsector and at promoting discussion about the implications for the subsector of the adoption of a unifying statement of principles. Models provided by other countries, including ASEAN countries such as Thailand and Malaysia, should inform this vision, which should also take account of the value of principles such as quality, efficiency, unity, equity and internationalization. The task of developing an enduring vision should go beyond simply finding a suitable form of words. The implications for the higher education subsector of making a long-term commitment to selected principles must be extensively discussed and properly appreciated. Ideally, the vision should be expressed in legislation currently under consideration to replace the *University Education Law* of 1973.
- Coordination and Planning. Because of its leadership of the NEC, the MoE has a highly significant role to play in coordinating and planning the higher education subsector. It is not clear, though, to what extent other ministries with line-management responsibilities for HEIs are obliged to comply with priorities and plans articulated by the MoE. Anecdotal reports suggest that ministries responsible for HEIs in Myanmar tend to act autonomously, and so the extent of national coordination of the subsector is limited, and there is a multiplicity of plans for its future. The UCC and the CUAB, because of their cross-sectoral membership, appear to be well placed to provide the subsector with a better capacity for coordination and planning, but their authority in this regard may need to be better outlined and more strongly reinforced in legislation being developed to replace the University Education Law of 1973. Some puzzling aspects of the current situation regarding the UCC and the CUAB include that they meet irregularly and briefly, and that that are hardly mentioned in either the 30-Year Long Term Education Development Plan or the more recent National Education Plan for Higher Education. These Plans are, however, deficient in the extent to which they neglect to assign accountabilities for the implementation of key objectives and targets, and in the extent to which no timelines are attached to the attainment of these key objectives and targets.
- 52. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be an evaluation of the effectiveness of the main national coordinating and planning bodies (especially the NEC and the UCC) in achieving national priorities for the higher education

³⁷ See, for example, Commission for the Review of the Master Plan for Higher Education. 1987. *The Master Plan Renewed: Unity, Equity, Quality and Efficiency in California Postsecondary Education.* Sacramento, CA.

subsector, and make policy recommendations as appropriate. There should also be capacity-building support to develop a plan for the higher education subsector — with an emphasis on the need to set explicit targets with associated accountabilities across all ministries responsible for HEIs and with clear timelines for the achievement of goals and objectives. In other words, the coordination and planning processes associated with the higher education subsector need to be comprehensively redeveloped, and a first step in this regard is to obtain a more detailed understanding of current strengths and weaknesses. Given these enhanced responsibilities, enhanced capacity would be needed — a trained, professional Secretariat, to service more regular meetings, and a wider agenda.

- Structure. The higher education subsector is structurally fragmented. Though the MoE is the largest higher education provider, accounting for about 77% of all higher education enrolments, the importance of the MoST as a provider of higher education programs is increasing – it now enrols about 18% of all higher education students, and there are 11 other ministries that also provide opportunities for participation in higher education. It is widely reported that the different ministries have their own conceptions about the nature of a university, and that there are also differences between them in terms of their curriculum and syllabus requirements, their quality standards, and the employment conditions they provide for their members of academic staff. These differences need to be better understood and documented. It is puzzling, for example, that salary levels of lecturers at HEIs managed by the MoST are higher than salary levels for lecturers at HEIs managed by the MoE. Anomalies deriving from the distribution of HEIs across ministries need to be documented and addressed. At issue here is also the question of why Myanmar would continue to have 13 different ministries responsible for HEIs. In many other higher education systems, the PRC being the most notable example from the East Asian region, this structural model has been abandoned.
- 54. A matter of particular concern for the subsector is that there is no unifying national qualifications framework. Given that there are 13 different ministries with line-management responsibilities for HEIs, the need for such a framework is critical. In 2007, the Government established a National Skills Standard Authority (NSSA) under the Ministry of Labour (MoL) with a brief to develop such a framework. Its focus was to develop occupational competency standards, but it did agree to a qualifications framework that had potentially significant implications for the higher education subsector. It assigned bachelor and postgraduate degrees to particular levels within the framework, and it also proposed that graduates should routinely be required to complete a test to ensure that their skills, knowledge and competencies complied with standards expected for the relevant qualification level. The Authority's deliberations were never properly concluded, and, to date, its proposals have not been addressed by the higher education subsector. Setting a test for all graduates for the purposes of establishing compliance with standards specified in the framework seems costly and administratively complex. A simpler approach would be to ensure that preferred graduate attributes are explicitly embedded in the curriculum for all bachelor and postgraduate programs.
- 55. It is not clear why the Authority embarked on the development of a national qualifications framework that might be unique to Myanmar. A simpler approach would have been to adopt UNESCO's International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED)³⁸ as the basis for a national qualifications framework for the national education system. In areas relating to tertiary education, the ISCED distinguishes between: (a) 'post-secondary non-tertiary' (Level 4) programs (essentially TVET programs); (b) 'short-cycle tertiary' (Level 5) programs (essentially TVET and sub-degree university programs); (c) 'bachelor or equivalent' (Level 6) programs; (d) 'master or equivalent' (Level 7) programs; and (e) doctoral or

³⁸ UNESCO. 2011. *International Standard Classification of Education 2011*. See http://www.uis.unesco.org/Education/Documents/UNESCO_GC_36C-19_ISCED_EN.pdf

equivalent' (Level 8) programs. Bachelor or equivalent (Level 6) programs typically require a proportion of lecturers (the size is not specified) who have a doctoral qualification, so that these programs are more theoretically based than Level 5 programs and so that graduates from these programs establish a sound foundation for proceeding to Level 7 and Level 8 programs. In Myanmar, however, a great many bachelor degree programs are delivered by lecturers who do not have a doctoral qualification. This situation raises a fundamental question for Myanmar's higher education subsector: could there already be too many If Myanmar's higher education subsector is to become degree-conferring HEIs? internationally credible, then internationally acceptable standards must apply to degree programs. Important among these is that a discernible proportion of all lecturers in degreelevel programs should have a doctoral qualification. If this standard cannot be met, then consideration might be given to reducing the number of degree-conferring institutions in Myanmar, and any further expansion of the number of these institutions may well need to be restricted. An alternative approach would be the phasing in of 'new-model' universities offering bachelor degree programs and higher that explicitly comply with standards documented in an internationally acceptable qualifications framework.

- 56. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase a capacity-building program should be implemented to facilitate the adoption of a national qualifications framework, such as UNESCO's ISCED, that differentiates in ways that are internationally recognised between degree-level and other qualification levels. By this means, policy-makers responsible for the higher education subsector should be assisted to understand the nature of a national qualifications framework, and consideration should specifically be given to the adoption of UNESCO's ISCED. The implications of adopting an internationally credible qualifications framework also need to be appreciated, including that the current number of degree-conferring HEIs in Myanmar may need to be reduced, or that a system of 'new-model' HEIs that are compliant with a qualifications framework may need to be phased in. It is recommended, therefore, that there should be an appraisal of all degree-conferring HEIs and all degree programs in light of an internationally accepted qualifications framework.
- 57. A related matter requiring attention concerns the long-term viability of having 13 ministries responsible for HEIs. On this matter, it is recommended that an options paper should be developed that addresses the viability of having one ministry only responsible for the higher education subsector.
- 58. Governance and Management. A civil service model of governance exists in the higher education subsector in Myanmar. Governance authority tends to be highly centralised and management processes are bureaucratic. Though HEIs have management committees that exercise a wide range of administrative responsibilities, and academic committees that address various academic matters, the important decisions must be made or approved centrally. It is the UCC, for example, that decides ultimately on matters relating to the degrees, diplomas and certificates that a university may confer, the enrolment quota for a university, the development of a research agenda, and the adequacy of academic staff qualifications; and the CUAB must make recommendation on matters related to systems of instruction in universities, rules and regulations for the conduct of university examinations, the academic qualifications required by members of academic staff for different levels of appointment, and any university advancement projects submitted by individual universities. In developed higher education systems, these matters are much more likely to be determined at the level of the individual institution.
- 59. The effects for Myanmar's higher education subsector of the minimal level of institutional autonomy available to HEIs have not been documented, but the experience of other higher education systems with centralised governance and bureaucratic management processes is that they are slow-moving in responding to the need for change, inefficient in

their utilisation of resources, and very constraining on innovation in teaching and research.³⁹ Higher education systems with a civil service model of governance, that is, where all staff members in HEIs are civil servants, are more prone to centralised governance and bureaucratic management processes, but there are numerous examples of civil service systems where decision-making authority has been significantly decentralised by giving responsibility to individual HEIs to manage their own affairs. Examples include nearly all of the higher education systems in continental Europe and most of the higher education systems in former Soviet-bloc countries.

- 60. An option for future consideration concerns whether or not to adopt a fully corporate model for governance of the higher education subsector. Within such a model, HEIs would be individually governed by their own institutional governing boards, which would take responsibility for everything from the employment of staff members (including the rector) to the management of resources and the determination of the institution's academic mission. This governance model is widely adopted in English-speaking countries, including former British colonies such as the United States, Canada and Australia. The development of a new *University Education Law* presents an opportunity for discussion about the kind of governance model that would best suit the future development of Myanmar's higher education subsector. If a civil service model is retained, HEIs should progressively be given more responsibility for managing their own affairs. If a corporate model is adopted, HEIs will need to be given a considerable amount of time to develop institutional forms of self-governance and to develop human resource capabilities in relation to institutional self-governance.
- 61. Rectors of HEIs in Myanmar are widely reported to have considerable authority because of the scope of their decision-making delegations. The criteria for their selection are not explicit, however, and there is a general lack of transparency about the process. Once appointed, they can remain in the role for an indefinite period, regardless of their effectiveness in achieving change. Given the pivotal importance of their role, issues relating to the appointment and accountability of rectors should be comprehensively identified and discussed. In a climate of rapid change for Myanmar's higher education subsector, a model of appointment based largely on seniority, and with limited opportunity for performance appraisal and professional development, may no longer be viable.
- It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase an options paper should be developed for detailed consideration by the NEC and UCC concerning governance and management models for the higher education subsector, drawing upon international trends in higher education governance and management, and addressing specifically issues related to a phase-in of the granting of institutional autonomy for HEIs and the establishment of transparent criteria for the selection and performance-review of rectors. HEIs in Myanmar are not all ready for institutional autonomy - indeed some may feel more at ease in not having it. It is recommended, therefore, that there should be a pilot project for the phasing in of institutional and financial autonomy at some of the strongest HEIs; that this project should be supported by providing adequate staff training, accompanied by adequate staff development of both institutional leaders and ministry/agency officials, and linked to QA and transparency measures; and that feedback from the pilot project should be incorporated into any extension of autonomy to further HEIs. The need for such an initiative is becoming pressing. It is evident that there is reluctance on the part of a significant proportion of policy makers to support continuation of the model of governance and management of HEIs that has prevailed for the past 50 years.⁴⁰

³⁹ For a more detailed account, see: World Bank. 2012. *Putting Higher Education To Work: Skills and Research for Growth in East Asia*. Washington, DC. pp.128-29.

⁴⁰ An initial draft of the new Higher Education Law was rejected by the *Pyithu Hluttaw* (Parliament) after members spoke strongly against the draft, arguing that it was too much like the earlier socialist-era University Education

- 63. **Finance and Private-Sector Investment**. The topic of finance for the education sector in Myanmar is addressed elsewhere as part of the CESR's agenda of topics for consideration,⁴¹ but details about how the subsector is funded are severely lacking. There is little doubt that Myanmar faces a critical policy issue concerning the provision of adequate funding for education. As noted earlier, the proportion of GDP spent on education is low in comparison with other countries across the Southeast Asian region. There is also a very high level of reliance on households to fund educational expenditure it is estimated that as much as 70% of total spending on education is by households, which is more than three times the rate in Lao PDR and almost four times the global average.⁴²
- In 2009-10, the 'unit cost' (the average cost per student per year) for university students undertaking regular programs was estimated to be 112.636 kyat (US\$131.97). which is well below what is required to support a properly functioning higher education subsector. Drawing on both site visits and related interviews, a picture showing that public HEIs were entirely dependent on their respective ministries for their budgets was revealed. Presumably in the interests of equity, tuition fees are kept low, with 20,000 kyats (US\$23.50) commonly cited. A policy of having low tuition fees is very much in accord with regional initiatives to move towards more inclusive higher education models, which do not discriminate against the poor, rural dwellers, women and ethnic minorities.⁴³ It also appears that poorer families may be quite sensitive in relation to changes in the level of tuition fees: in HEIs managed by the Ministry of Defence and all students are employees and have military ranks, no fees are applied, a practice that, according to one Rector allowed these HEIs to ensure that perhaps half their intake came from rural areas, with another 30% coming from poor families. For these reasons, as well as because of the potential political impact that a tuition fee increase could have, it is recommended that any proposal to lift tuition fees in public sector HEIs should first be carefully modelled for impact on equity, particularly regarding rural and disadvantaged groups.
- 65. HRD programs generate additional fee income for some HEIs,⁴⁴ and this income has the advantage of being able to be spent more or less at the discretion of the HEI earning the income. There is a risk, however, that the incentive provided by the opportunity to earn income from HRD programs could divert attention from the need to improve the quality of the 'regular' programs provided for full-time undergraduate students. There are numerous examples from across the Southeast Asian region of instances where less-controlled 'non-regular' programs have become a priority concern for universities with missions requiring them to be much more focused on the provision of regular programs. HRD programs are normally delivered on evenings and at weekends.⁴⁵ Introduced in 1998, and with no entry exams other than for admission at the master-degree level, these programs have become quite popular. There is even some support at senior levels of the MOE for their extension.

Law of 1973. Speakers against the draft blamed government control of university management for the "degeneration" of tertiary education standards in Myanmar over the past five decades. Daw Tin Nwe Oo (NDF *Pyithu Hluttaw* representative for North Dagon) said universities should be "autonomous bodies ... free of the government's control . . . If higher education, which is crucial to build the capacity of the younger generation, remains under the shadow of the old system of government, it may pose a danger to political and economic stability. Therefore the higher education bill presented today should be thrown out by the *hluttaw* and a law that enables universities to become self-administered should be enacted. She said the new bill should allow universities to freely form a council to administer the university, to form a teaching faculty to draw up their own syllabus and curriculum, to freely contact and seek support from government bodies, to freely raise funds and spend them as they see fit, to hire foreign academics and teachers, to accept foreign students and to include dormitories at the university. The university council should also be allowed to draw up its own by-laws and procedures." Myanmar Times 2012.

⁴³ ADB 2012. Counting the Cost. Financing Higher Education for Inclusive Growth in Asia. Manila.

_

⁴¹ See World Bank and AusAID. 2013. Rapid Assessment of the Financing of the Education Sector in Myanmar.

⁴² Footnote 36, p.7.

But not in MOST evidently, which shut down such programs at its universities. Footnote 30, p.91.
 Department of Higher Education (Lower Myanmar) (2012). Higher Education in Myanmar. p. 13.

They offer more autonomy to HEIs, and are supposedly more in tune with labour market demands. The programs include short (3-4 month) certificate courses, longer (9-12 month) undergraduate and graduate diploma courses, three-year bachelor degrees and two-year master degrees. Just as in neighbouring countries, classes are often held at locations well away from the site of the host institution, resulting in some difficulties for staff in rushing from one location to the other. For teachers at Yangon University, for example: "The need to hold regular classes at out-of-town facilities and to rush back to the main campus to conduct evening diploma and postgraduate courses has also inflicted considerable physical and mental stress on the teaching staff and taken a heavy toll on them."

- 66. HEIs were, understandably perhaps, reluctant to release data as to the extent of income earned from HRD programs, or on the proportion that such income represents as part of their total institutional budgets. Some HEIs, however, while lamenting the inadequate financial support provided by their line-managing ministry ("no increase in annual budgets in recent years"), and the limits this imposed on the quality of teaching, learning and research, and the purchase and/or renewal of much-needed equipment, have nonetheless resisted introducing HRD programmes, preferring to lobby their line-managing ministry for additional funds. One explanation for this approach is that HEIs are "not used to autonomy", which is perhaps an understandable stance given the extent of command and control of administration of higher education in Myanmar over many decades.
- 67. The experience of neighbouring Southeast Asian systems with HRD-equivalent programs is instructive. In Indonesia, Thailand and Malaysia, for example, programs variously termed 'diploma', 'executive' or 'extension' courses are common. Introduced in part as a response to the widening gap between spiralling enrolments and limited public financial support, they are often problematic, and a common source of complaint.⁴⁸ Taught in the evening and at weekends by the same staff as teach regular programs, the courses parallel mainstream programs, but with much higher fees, but much lower (or no) entry standards. They are often taught off-campus, sometimes in shopping centres, without facilities; and quality is often poor. In some cases, the qualifications that result are not accepted as legitimate (particularly for the purpose of public employment). While some individual academics gain considerable additional income from such activities, especially in highdemand areas such as business, IT and foreign languages, the quality of teaching, learning and infrastructure, as well as financial accountability, have been criticised, and it is not clear that the extra income generated always supports the institution, as opposed simply to supporting individuals. In effect, these parallel programs are one side of the Janus face of privatisation of higher education in Asia. 49 One side is represented by the swifter growth of the private sector than the public in many systems in recent years. The other side is the privatization of public HEIs, which are pushed to diversify their income sources as a result of the pressure to accommodate more students without commensurate public support.
- 68. Another source of funds is private-sector investment. There are currently no legally recognised private HEIs in Myanmar, though it is reported that a private higher education law is under development, and various business interests and faith-based groups are known to be waiting for its approval in the expectation that it will enable them to establish private universities and colleges. Private higher education programs are, however, already being accessed in Myanmar. A professional development unit within the *Myanmar Medical Association*, for example, provides continuing education and postgraduate training to qualified private-sector medical doctors, estimated to total 22,000, who are ineligible to

⁴⁷ University World News. 2012. Restoring Yangon University to its Former Glory Captures Public Mood. 5 August. ⁴⁸ Welch, A Higher Education in Southeast Asia. (Op Cit), pp. 81-2, 104. In Malaysia, complaints about such programs are among the commonest forms of consumer complaint. For a brief review of the tension between enrollments and state support, see ADB (2012), pp. 6-8.

¹⁹ For more on this phenomenon, see A. Welch. 2011. *Higher Education in South East Asia. (Op cit)*.

⁴⁶ JICA. 2012. Data Collection Survey on Education Sector in Myanmar. p. 90.

access postgraduate programs in Myanmar's public HEIs. These doctors also access distance education programs, such as an online course conducted by the Department of Global Health at the University of Washington. Other forms of private higher education include colleges providing vocation-specific training in areas such as tourism and engineering, and colleges offering academic foundation programs as a preparation for studies abroad. Providers of these programs are not registered – indeed, the Director of one such private institution lamented the lack of an official response to an application made for registration. The institutions depend largely on fees for income - site visits confirmed that donations and other forms of financial support were absent. The only form of semi-financial support was in the form of internships for students provided by local tourist hotels and engineering firms for periods of two to three months in the fourth (and final) semester of their two-year diploma course. 50 Fees at one such college, established in 2011 by an expatriate Burmese national from the United Kingdom, were set at US\$300 per month, which would clearly exclude all but students from wealthy families. The same tuition fee level was levied for 'pre-foundation' courses of five months in duration for students whose English and Mathematics were judged to be inadequate. No scholarship support was available. The implications for equity are obvious. The business appeared to be financially viable, but laboratories visited lacked equipment - though, in this regard, they may not be much different from laboratories in public HEIs.

- 69. In developing a private higher education law, Myanmar should seek to include provisions that will save it from repeating mistakes made by other ASEAN nations in which controls on quality and the extent of profit-making have had to be introduced reactively and belatedly. Myanmar's private higher education law should regulate the scale of the profits that may be extracted by shareholders and managers from private HEIs. It should also impose national quality standards on these institutions. Private HEIs are invariably permitted to employ a corporate governance model (often in contrast to the civil service model required for public HEIs), but governments often neglect to require some representation on the governing boards of these institutions for the purposes of reinforcing social accountability.
- 70. Myanmar does not have any legislation that would permit the establishment of strictly 'not-for-profit' HEIs that might more easily attract State subsidies, and that might also attract private donations from philanthropists and donations from Myanmar nationals living abroad. It is not known how well understood 'not-for-profit' models of private higher education are in Myanmar, but this model is common enough across East Asian countries. It is also the model adopted by leading private universities in the United States. Within this model, there are no individual shareholders, and so there is no distribution of profits to individuals. Any financial surplus must be reinvested in the institution.
- 71. Neither does Myanmar appear to have any legislation that provides incentives for the provision of private-sector financial support for students and for universities whether in the form of scholarships, endowments, donations for capital works or public-private capital raising ventures. The recent passage of the *Foreign Investment Law* (in November 2012) has implications for the establishment of branch campuses in Myanmar, although these are not mentioned in the document's text. There is substantial and growing interest by foreign donors, agencies and governments in Myanmar's higher education system, but this interest needs to be regulated in order to contribute to strengthening the system. Among relevant issues are: how much profit may be earned by a foreign branch campus in Myanmar, can it be expatriated, who has the controlling interest, and/or can the campus be fully foreign owned? The experience of neighbouring states is relevant here Viet Nam for example, has

⁵⁰ In this case, the exit qualification was said to be a UK Higher National Diploma (HND), operated by a UK Examinations authority known as Edexcel. The qualification is described as follows: "A vocational qualification, usually studied full-time, but can be studied part-time. It is roughly equivalent to the first two years of a 3 year degree level study, or to the <u>Diploma of Higher Education</u>."

allowed the development of fully foreign-owned campuses, whereas the PRC insists that such ventures must be majority Chinese controlled. While education is not cited specifically, apparently relevant provisions in the *Foreign Investment Law* include some tax exemption or relief for 5 years, and, if profits are re-invested, accelerated depreciation, deduction of R&D expenses (Chapter XII), training provisions (Chapter XI), guarantees of non-nationalisation (Chapter XIII), the Right to Use Land (Chapter XIV) and the right to remit reasonable profits (Chapter XVI).

- 72. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase capacity-building support should be provided for the development of a comprehensive financial database on the higher education subsector, and subsequently for the analysis of the data, including modelling of the financial impact of measures such as raising student tuition fees and introducing a private higher education sector. The social impact of these measures, particularly concerning equity, should also be assessed. The implications of the Foreign Investment Law (2012), and any other relevant laws, should be scrutinised for their impact on the operation of foreign branch campus projects.
- 73. **Quality Assurance**. There is no national quality assurance framework for the higher education subsector in Myanmar, and current discussion of quality assurance methods does not appear to be well informed by international standards of best practice. The proposal favoured by the NSSA whereby recent graduates might have their skills, knowledge and competencies assessed against qualification standards seems to be as far as discussion has progressed. The adoption of a national qualifications framework is to be encouraged, but it does not seem practicable to have a special test of skills, knowledge and competencies completed by all recent graduates. A less costly approach would be to build certain skill, knowledge and competency requirements into the curriculum of all bachelor-degree programs.
- 74. A quality assurance framework for the higher education subsector in Myanmar would seek to ensure that all HEIs accept responsibility for the quality of the degrees and other qualifications they award. It would entail the observance of protocols for the approval of new training programs, the cyclical review of existing training programs, and the audit of institutional quality assurance processes. At present, the CUAB has responsibility for recommending the approval of all new training programs and for the approval of recommended changes to existing courses. It is not clear from the available documentation, however, how thorough this process is, nor is the scope of the activities of the CUAB all that clearly evident. Academic committees in HEIs make recommendations to the CUAB, but the extent of their ability to make minor changes to programs is difficult to establish. Neither is it clear to what extent they are responsible for implementing cyclical processes of review of existing training programs. There appears at present to be no process of auditing quality assurance processes being undertaken by HEIs. Neither is there any apparent mechanism whereby the overall quality of the higher education subsector is appraised. There is no single agency that has responsibility for collecting data in relation to performance indicators for the subsector.
- 75. The higher education subsector faces significant challenges in terms of quality assurance. There are technical issues to be addressed the identification of performance indicators that embrace a wide range of teaching and research aspirations for the subsector, and the development of a national quality assurance agency that is independent of Government ministries and completely transparent in its proceedings. There are issues related to data collection and management quality assurance processes rely on the availability of information about procedures being adopted and performances being achieved, and the costs associated with the collection and analysis of this information cannot be ignored, especially in the context of a developing economy. There are also issues that relate directly to the question of institutional autonomy in leading higher education systems it is

normal for the academic community of a university to approve new training programs, to review them periodically and adjust them as required, and to exercise responsibility for the maintenance of an institutionally-based quality assurance framework. In Myanmar's context, the Government will demonstrate a high level of confidence in the higher education subsector when it feels ready to transfer these responsibilities to academic committees within HEIs.

76. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be capacity-building support provided to enable the development of an affordable and realistic quality assurance model for the higher education subsector — one takes account of international standards of quality in higher education. There is also a need for capacity-building support to develop performance indicators for possible adoption by the higher education subsector. Identify for and against the introduction of an external (to ministries) national accreditation agency (such as the BAN-PT in Indonesia).

D. Access and Equity

77. This section of the report addresses urgent priorities and reform issues in the higher education subsector regarding access and equity. It also seeks to develop relevant recommendations for areas requiring in-depth sector analysis during the CESR's second phase. Table 2 presents an overview of the contents of this section.

Table 5: Access and Equity Recommendations: Overview

Priority Areas	Issues	Recommendations
Equity	While it has been argued that "It is important now more than ever that these five pillars of Myanmar society [farmers, workers, students, monks and the military] again create an atmosphere of empathy and trust and work towards the common goal of developing the nation", available data reveal significant disparities in terms of social indices, notably poverty, and between rural and urban environments, that are mirrored to a degree in the higher education system.	Provide support for the modelling of the relative costs and benefits of widening higher education access, including careful consideration of the balance between public and private higher education. Model impact of raising fees. Develop an index of minimum quality, including threshold teacher-student ratios, ratios of qualified teachers (with masters and/or PhDs), and costs of related facilities, such as libraries, and laboratories, especially in rural and minority areas. Investigate more closely links between early school leaving, (rural, ethnic, poverty) and differential H/Ed. access.
Ethnicity	As the IHLCS survey indicated: " prospects for entry into middle school appear to be weakest for ethnic group students from remote rural areas, who may also have weaker academic preparedness, increasing their risk of dropout if they do enter secondary education." The same is very likely to be true in terms of participation and progression in higher education.	Develop a comprehensive database of educational participation (via EMIS, or a possible HEMIS) at all levels of education, by ethnicity, not merely for the Rohingyas, but for Myanmar's "rich tapestry of peoples", including for example, Kachin, Karen, and Shan.
Gender	Significant gender disparities are evident in the Myanmar context.	Investigate reasons behind higher female participation rates in higher education, and very high rates among the academic labour force, (at levels up to and including Professor, but not above?).
Student loans	Without a robust and transparent taxation system, solid means of measuring total family income, thorough preparation and training by either banks, or state agencies charged with implementing loans schemes, and considerable system transparency, there are considerable risks of default, and	Implement a project to enhance the effectiveness of equity measures by improving the robustness, and quality of the financial data upon which the decisions are based, to ensure, for example, that student loans (and scholarships) go to those who need them

	significant incidence of loans going to middle class students, rather than needy students for whom they were designed.	most.
Private tuition classes	Despite high fees for 'tuition classes' – often taught by the same teachers as in the regular program, but on the weekend or in the evening – they remain popular. Do they perform the same function as 'crammers' at secondary level, and what is the impact on equity?	Investigate reasons for popularity of private tuition classes among higher education students, including the link between these and regular programs. Examine equity effects. Develop options paper for consideration by the NEC and the UCC.

78. **Equity**. Traditionally, Myanmar society is characterised as being firmly based on five pillars: farmers, workers, students, monks and the military. All Myanmar schoolchildren are introduced to heroes from these categories that occupy a special place in the national pantheon. ⁵¹ In practice, however, coherence and national cohesion are not so simply achieved, including in higher education. While it has been argued that "It is important now more than ever that these five pillars of Myanmar society again create an atmosphere of empathy and trust and work towards the common goal of developing the nation", ⁵² the data revealing troubling disparities in social indices, notably poverty, and between rural and urban environments, are mirrored to a degree in the higher education system, as seen in Table 3, that underlines the dominance of the two major cities (Yangon and Mandalay) in the distribution of HEIs across Myanmar.

Table 6: Distribution of HEIs, by State and Region, Myanmar 2012⁵³

State Region Number	State/Region Name	Number of HEIs
1	Kachin	9
2	Kayah	3
3	Kayin	4
4	Chin	3
5	Sagaing	14
6	Tanintharyi	7
7	Bago	9
8	Magway	11
9	Mandalay	36
10	Mon	4
11	Rakhine	5
12	Yangon	33
13	Shan	14
14	Ayerwaddy 12	
TOTAL		164

79. Such inequality is exacerbated by the relative inadequacy of scholarships, and by the associated costs of higher education. Discussions with a group of students from Rakhine state studying in Yangon underlined the substantial costs to their parents of coming to Yangon, and the ongoing costs of their accommodation. A few poorer students were entitled to a very modest scholarship, of 300 kyats per month, but the students claimed that the amount was hardly worth the trouble of making an application. ⁵⁴

⁵³ MoE. 2012. *Higher Education in Myanmar: Structure, Long Term Plans*. Yangon. pp. 31-2. Note that other documents (e.g. footnote 25) show Sagaing as having 13 HEIs, yielding a total of 163 HEIs.

_

⁵¹ Tin, H. 2008. Myanmar Education: challenges, prospects and options. In M. Skidmore and T. Wilson, eds. *Dictatorship, Disorder and Decline in Myanmar*. Canberra, ANU e-Press. pp.113-126. Traditionally, teachers have been seen as one of the five 'gems', considered on the same plane as Buddha (a teacher), Scriptures, monks and parents. But "malpractice and corruption" are eroding their status and commitment. (p. 115) ⁵² Ibid., p. 113.

⁵⁴ A benchmark that provides a useful measure of the reach of the scholarship is that the price of a bowl of noodles at the student canteen is 1,000 kyats. The Myanmar 'Noodle Index' arguably fulfils something of the same function as the 'Big Mac' index, sometimes used to assess costs of living in other contexts.

- 80. Clearly, the process of differentiation begins much earlier in life, with rates of on-time primary completions in Rakhine (31.7%) and Shan (North), for example, being less than half the rate of Yangon (70.1%).⁵⁵ Out-of-school rates reveal a similar pattern with rates of 52.9% in Rakhine, and 40.2% in Shan (East) being both markedly higher than in Yangon (18.1%).⁵⁶ Hence the eradication of differentials in higher education participation cannot be viewed in isolation. Spohr's assessment that a mere 10% of students who enter the system, survive until the end of year 11 underlines that dropout is a substantial constraint, especially at the point of transition to the secondary stage: "fully one in four primary school completers never entered middle school".⁵⁷ Only 33.6% of rural children aged 10 have completed primary schooling, compared with 55.7% of urban children of the same age. Poverty deepens this disparity.
- 81. Spohr's analysis shows further marked differences at the secondary level, with participation rates for pupils aged 10-15 averaging 83.3% for urban dwellers, compared to 65.6% for rural. Even more troubling is that more than half of the children (52.4%) at this age from the poorest quintile are already out of school (see also IHLCS, *passim*, including Table 4, where both direct and opportunity costs are shown to be the major barrier). The equivalent figure for children of the wealthiest quintile is 9.5%. Maternal education levels were also an important discriminant of children aged 10-15 with mothers without education, 48.6% were out of school, compared with 33.0% for those with mothers who had completed primary schooling, and 10.5% for those with mothers who had completed secondary schooling. This pattern is likely to correspond to SES differences.
- 82. While complete data is as yet unavailable (exacerbated by the absence of any census data since 1983), stark differences are evident: in Yangon, 80% of children aged 10-15 are in school, while in Rakhine, the equivalent figure is 47.1%. The fact that more than half of school children between the ages of 10 and 15 in Rakhine are already out of school represents not merely a troubling failure in equity terms, but a major loss of system efficiency, with direct implications for higher education access and equity. World Bank data, based on analysis of the 2010 IHLCS data, confirm this pattern of unequal access: "the highest income quintile are over three times more likely to attain a tertiary education as those from the lowest income quintile".
- 83. All in all, the data are indicative of major and ongoing disparities; but more systematic data are needed. Rates of repetition, particularly at the upper secondary level, are also troublingly high, suggestive of "broader gaps in mastery of subject content". ⁶² The emergence of private schools ('crammers'?) at Year 11 is also troubling, given the link referred to above between poverty and equity. Together with what is the almost ubiquitous extent of what is commonly termed 'parrot' (rote) learning, this situation provides a poor basis for quality higher education. Evidence suggesting that even teachers exposed to more inquiry-based and child-centred forms of pedagogy often revert to rote forms of instruction after a time suggests the need for ongoing professional development. The use of English as the medium of instruction for maths and sciences in high schools and HEIs needs to be enhanced, since there is some evidence that it may be associated with a tendency towards

lbid., p. 11.

_

⁵⁵ ADB 2012, PPE in Myanmar (Op cit). The stark pattern of differentiation, if not the completion rates, is the same in IHLCS (Table 7).

⁵⁶ Ibid, Annex 1.

⁵⁷ Ibid, p. 8.

⁵⁸ Ibid, p. 9.

⁵⁹ Ibid, p. 11.

⁶⁰ lbid, p. 10. For more in increasing rural-urban disparities, see I. Okamoto. 2008. *Economic Disparity in Rural Myanmar: Transformation under Market Liberalization*. Singapore: NUS Press.

World Bank 2012a, Knowledge Economy Index (Op. Cit.), Figure 4, p. 9, shows that less than 10 per cent of the lowest income quintile have tertiary education, relative to just under 30 per cent for the highest quintile.

memorization of stock phrases and technical terms, (especially for the matriculation exam), rather than with a more comprehensive and deeper understanding. ⁶³

- 84. National cohesion, and inclusive education, at all levels, including higher education, is, however, both an opportunity and a challenge for Myanmar. The assessment expressed above, based on ADB documents, national policies of ASEAN and other Asian nations, and careful analysis of relevant data, supports the view that inclusive higher education is justified on both economic and equity grounds. As observed by the ADB in a recent analysis of the financing of higher education in Asia, "Any higher education system that fails to cultivate the breadth of talent in society men and women, rural and urban, rich and poor is sacrificing both quality and efficiency." The benefits of inclusive growth are clear: gains in equity and efficiency. The risks of failing to pursue inclusive growth policies, including in education, are equally clear, according to a separate ADB analysis of such policies. Three potential outcomes are pointed to in particular: the stalling of reforms, resulting in lower growth, and higher inequalities; rising absolute income and consumption gaps between richest and poorest quintiles, which could trigger social and economic tensions; and, in extreme forms, armed conflict. 66
- 85. Having regard to the need for better data on which to base decision making in support of equity objectives, it is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be a support provided for the modelling of the relative costs and benefits of widening higher education access, including careful consideration of the balance between public and private higher education. This analysis should include the development of an index of minimum quality that includes threshold teacher-to-student ratios, ratios of qualified teachers (with masters and/or PhDs), and costs of related facilities, such as libraries, and laboratories, especially in rural and minority areas.
- 86. **Ethnicity**. A significant fissure illustrating these risks relates to Myanmar's ethnic makeup, comprising some 135 ethnic groups. While President Obama's argument on his recent visit that "diversity is a strength and not a weakness", that "your country will be stronger because of many different cultures, but you have to seize that opportunity. You have to recognise that strength", and that "no process of reform will succeed without national reconciliation", resonated with the audience, drawing some of the strongest applause from the large crowd packed into the Yangon University's Convocation Hall, in practice, ethnic tensions continue to undermine national cohesion. This set of circumstances is particularly significant, given the multidimensional composition of disadvantage: as the IHLCS survey indicated: "... prospects for entry into middle school appear to be weakest for ... ethnic group students from remote rural areas, who may also have weaker academic preparedness, increasing their risk of dropout if they do enter secondary education." The same is very likely to be true in terms of participation and progression in higher education.
- 87. Riots in Rakhine state in June and October 2012, that were said to have resulted in 50 deaths and the displacement of thousands, largely Muslim Rohingyas, are but the latest incarnation of longstanding sectarian tensions. Several reputable external sources have characterized this situation as a form of ethnic cleansing. Discussions with students from Rakhine underlined the serious educational outcomes: whereas at one educational institution,

_

⁶⁸ IHLCS, 2012.

⁶³ Ibid., p.13.

⁶⁴ ADB 2012c Counting the Cost..., p. 1.

⁶⁵ ADB. 2010. Poverty, Inequality and Inclusive Growth in Asia: Measurement, Policy Issues and Country Studies. Manila.

Manila.

66 I. Ali and J. Zhuang. 2007. *Inclusive Growth Toward a Prosperous Asia: Policy Implications*. ERD Working Paper No 97. Manila: ADB. See also ADB 2010 *Poverty...,* (Op. Cit.). and ADB 2012c *Counting the Cost.* (Op. Cit).

Cit). ⁶⁷ Inside Story 2012. Back to Work in Myanmar. 21 November.

Rohingvas had comprised 40 per cent of enrolments before the incidents, only one Rohingva student remained enrolled after the events. The outcomes of an internal investigation commissioned in August by President Thein Sein are awaited, but may not address specific educational issues that arise from the contradictory situation of the Rohingyas, notably their ineligibility for professional higher education on the basis that they are not defined as citizens. (despite having lived in Myanmar for centuries).⁶⁹ The persistence of a widespread view, not merely among the estimated three million Rakhine Buddhists, 70 but also among the majority of non-Muslim citizens nationally, including militant Buddhist monks, that Rohingyas are 'intruders', is at odds with the inclusive education policies of several neighbouring ASEAN and East Asian states, and agencies such as the World Bank and ADB.

The incipient rebellion by Kachin poses another ethnic problem, and again illustrates the tension between militant Therayada Buddhism and other religions, since the Kachin, who inhabit Myanmar's northern mountain region as well as some areas in Shan state, are largely Christian. ⁷¹ Despite signing a ceasefire in 1994, problems such as "dispossession from their land, forced internal resettlement, and forced labour...when the government launched infrastructure projects" have re-surfaced intermittently, provoking both resistance and repression. Tens of thousands of locals have been displaced since the breakdown of the ceasefire in June 2011, 73 health indicators remain poor, and include HIV and problems associated with heroin use (since Kachin state is in the 'Golden Triangle'). Most recently, sources in the *Tatmadaw* have acknowledged the use of helicopters and military jets to quell resistance by Kachin fighters who refused to abandon a base near a joint venture hydropower plant, partnering with a PRC company. 74 PRC assent to the *Tatmadaw's* efforts have been alleged: "China needs the Myanmar army more than it needs the KIO." President U Thein Sein has committed his government to "granting equal constitutional rights to all national races, despite political differences", and in a major speech to officials at the end of 2012, called on "our ethnic brothers ... to work hand-in-hand with the government in undertaking all the necessary reforms in the country." 76 Yet the fact that such views clearly draw on the longstanding and widespread support of many, if not most, Myanmar citizens may make moves towards inclusive higher education policies complex. It was repeatedly stated in response to enquiries for the purposes of developing the present report that no data exists on higher education access and participation by ethnicity, hence a recommendation for the second phase of the CESR, as a first step towards rational planning outcomes, is the development of a comprehensive database of educational participation (via EMIS) at all

⁶⁹ Non-citizens in Myanmar were traditionally eligible for general higher education but not for the professional strands (medicine, engineering etc). Recently however, if a prospective student could demonstrate Myanmar citizenship on the part of one parent, this barrier might be waived. The current situation is somewhat fluid.

70 Rohingyas are estimated to number 800,000, some of whom have fled to Bangladesh, which in response,

positioned troops along its border, turning away many refugees.

71 The fact that two-thirds of the Kachin minority are Christian, and that U Nu tried to impose Buddhism as the state religion in about 1960, fanned the flames of Kachin independence, and in turn led to significant state repression (M. Smith. 1994. Ethnic Groups in Burma. Development, Democracy and Human Rights. London: Anti-Slavery International. pp. 38-41.

UNHCR (n.d.) Assessment for Kachins in Burma. Refworld. See http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/country,,MARP,,MMR,,469f3a601e,0.html. The Nation. 2013. Myanmar Military Admits Air Strikes Against Kachin Rebels. 4 January. The Nation. 2013. Can the Kachin Survive War's Escalation by Myanmar Forces? 4 January.

Myanmar Times. 2013. Kachin Air Strikes are 'self-defence', says Government. 7-13 January.

⁷⁴ The Age. 2013. Army Unrest Undermines Burma Denial of Strikes on Rebels. 4 January. The Nation. 2013. Myanmar Military Admits Air Strikes ..., 4 January. Myanmar Times. 2013. Fighting Rages in Kachin State. 7-13 January. ⁷⁵ *The Nation*. 2013. Can the Kachin Survive...? 4 January.

⁷⁶ New Light of Myanmar. 2013. 'No Problem unsolvable with mutual trust, understanding and empathy: President'. 6 January. Myanmar President Office. 2012. 'President U Thein Sein delivers an Address at the Meeting on Reform to Improve Management and Administrative Capacity of the Government'. See http://www.president-office.gov.mm/en/briefing-room/speeches-and-remarks/2012/12/26/id-1320

levels of education, by ethnicity, not merely for the Rohingyas, but for Myanmar's "rich tapestry of peoples", 77 including for example, Kachin, Karen, and Shan.

89. Gender. Significant gender disparities are evident in the Myanmar context. Prima facie, in terms of both student enrolments and staff numbers, females appear to be favoured. with for example 306,687 females enrolled in higher education, but only 204,204 males (based on an estimated total of 510,890). 78 The proportion seems relatively stable over time, at least in Arts and Science universities, with the proportion ranging from 65.96% in 2003-2004 to 68.03% in 2008-2009. At times, it has reached over 70%. 79 In effect, females outnumber males 1.5: 1 overall, and more so at Arts and Science HEIs. While the proportion of females to males is almost 2:1 at the undergraduate level (although not in distance education), disparities are even greater at higher degree levels, as Table 7 demonstrates:

Table 7: Proportions of Male and Female Enrolments, Higher Education 2012, by Degree⁸⁰

Degree	No. of Males	No. of Females	Total	% Female
Undergraduate	58,469	109,748	168,217	65.2
" (Distance)	125,986	158,258	284,244	55.7
Honours	981	5,573	6,554	85.0
MA/M. Sc. (Qualifying)	148	897	1,045	85.8
Post-Grad Dipl.	459	1,266	1,725	73.4
Masters	1,291	5,333	6,624	80.5
Masters of Research	64	386	450	85.8
Ph. D.	394	1,659	2,053	80.8
Total	187,792	283,210	470,912	60.1 ⁸¹

Source: Adapted from Panorama of Myanmar Higher Education 2012, p.26

Gender disparities in enrolments are paralleled by the even-greater preponderance of 90. females among academic staff, with 82.6% being female overall. 82 Table 5 shows numbers and proportions of females at various levels.

Table 5: Numbers and Proportions of Female Academics, 2012, by Rank⁸³

Rank	No. of Males	No. of Females	Total	% Female
Professor	178	605	783	77.3
Associate Prof.	153	614	767	80.5
Lecturer	513	3,134	3,647	85.9
Assistant Lecturer	531	2,580	3,111	82.9
Tutor/Demonstrator	534	2,118	2,652	79.9
Total	1,909	9,051	10,960	82.6

Various reasons are given for this situation. When asked, males tended to ascribe 91. the phenomenon, at times airily, at times with a degree of unease, to the fact that teaching as a profession is seen to be appropriate for women (and, by implication, not for men). Women countered with the more pragmatic view that low salaries make the profession unattractive to

⁷⁷ Smith, M., (1994) *Ethnic Groups ...* (Op. Cit). .

ADB 2012f *Initial Assessment* ..., (Op. cit.),, p. 21. Again, some sources cite a total enrolment of 470,000, while at least one cites over 600, 000.

MoL. 2011. Handbook on Human Resources Indicators, 2009. Nay Pyi Taw.

⁸⁰ Adapted from *Panorama of Myanmar Higher Education 2012*. p. 26. Note: the figures are based on a total student number of 470,902. Other sources that cite significantly higher figures would be unlikely to affect the

gender ratios substantially.

81 Without the relatively balanced gender ratios in distance education, the overall proportion of females (60.1) would be significantly higher.

Panorama of Myanmar Higher Education (2012). (Op. Cit)

⁸³ Adapted from footnote 25, p. 26. Note: this Table is based on a total staffing number of 10,960. Other sources that cite considerably higher figures would be unlikely to affect the gender ratios substantially.

men, while also pointing to the persistence of traditional, narrow views of what is appropriate for women. In effect, it would seem that men have wider options, and take them, leaving higher education as only one choice. Females, having fewer career options, are far more likely to choose an academic career. While disaggregated figures for higher education were not available, the IHLCS shows that, for the overall sector, employment in education represented 1.0% of the overall male workforce, compared with 4.9% for women.⁸⁴ It is also important to be reminded of the assessment of the IHLCS that girls between 10 and 15 are more vulnerable to SES effects: "poverty (and rurality) appears to more strongly affect female dropouts". A further finding of the IHLCS is that the educational level of the mother is of particular importance in girls' educational completion rates (something supported by the international literature).

- 92. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be a comprehensive investigation of the reasons why female participation rates in higher education generally, and across the academic labour force, are consistently higher than those for males.
- Student loans. A widely adopted strategy used to finance enrolments growth is that 93. of student loans schemes, which appear to offer the benefit of sustaining expansion without increased costs to the state. Of the two principal forms, mortgage type schemes and income-contingent loans, each has their proponents and critics. A recent ADB review of the Asian experience with student loans, however, counsels caution: "PRC, India, Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand and Viet Nam, among a number of other countries have all experimented with student loans in recent years – often with rather disappointing results."85 A key finding was that without a robust and transparent taxation system, solid means of measuring family income, thorough preparation and training by either banks, or state agencies charged with implementing loans schemes, and considerable system transparency, there were considerable risks of default, as well as a significant incidence of loans going to middle class students, rather than needy students for whom they were designed. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be a project to enhance the effectiveness of equity measures by improving the quality of the financial data upon which the decisions are based, to ensure, for example, that student loans and scholarships go to those who need The implementation of this recommendation would necessitate some training/capacity development, as well as liaison with national taxation authorities, and possibly banks, and social welfare agencies.
- 94. **Private Tuition Classes**. One predictable effect of low unit-cost levels is that salaries in the higher education subsector are low. Though recent rises of 30,000 kyats (US\$35) per month are an improvement, academic staff in HEIs, rather like school-teachers and other public sector officials, are forced to supplement their low salaries by providing additional fee-based private tuition classes, mostly of exactly the same material being taught in their regular classes. This set of circumstances has at least two perverse outcomes, the first being that poor students, denied access to these extra classes on account of their cost, may fail, irrespective of their academic merit; and the second being that teachers, who depend on the income generated from these extra classes, may curtail their regular classes, citing as an excuse that "I taught this in my tuition class, so I won't teach it now (in the regular class)". 86
- 95. Private classes can be quite expensive: estimates of 200,000-400,000 kyats (US\$235-US\$470) per month have been quoted if the classes are individually based, and less per student if there is a group. As is common in neighbouring ASEAN states, low rates

_

⁸⁴ IHLCS 2012.

⁸⁵ ADB 2012c Counting the Cost (Op. cit.), p. 13.

⁸⁶ Interview with students from Rakhine, December 2012.

of remuneration in public HEIs encourage 'moonlighting', with associated reductions in availability and commitment at public HEIs. As one Rector put it, moonlighting by academic staff has in effect become 'mandatory' in order to earn money for the education of one's children.⁸⁷ It is also commonly the case that teachers at private HEIs are either refugees (or retirees) from public HEIs, or they 'moonlight' part-time while employed full-time at public HEIs. ⁸⁸ At site visits, public sector academic salaries were described derisively as 'chickenfeed'.

96. Table 6 provides details of salaries for different academic ranks. The data in Table 6 reveal that the mid-point monthly salary level of 125,000 kyats (about US\$1,765 per year) for a Lecturer at a public HEI is a little more than double the average GDP per capita of US\$857. This is somewhat higher than for a Lecturer in Lao PDR public-sector HEIs, for example, who earns US\$1,440 per year. ⁸⁹ For a full Professor, the mid-point salary level of 165,000 kyats per month (or US\$2329 per year) represents 2.7 times per capita GDP. Does a comparison of salary levels with other jobs, support the contention that academic salaries are 'chickenfeed', and if so, how far does this help explain the pronounced gender imbalance in the Myanmar academic profession, at least in public sector HEIs?

Rank Salary, in Kyats Rector 210,000 - 220,000 180.000 - 190.000 Pro-Rector Professor (Head of Department) 160,000 - 170,000 Professor 160,000 - 170,000 140,000 - 150,000 Associate Professor 120,000 - 130,000 Lecturer Assistant Lecturer 100,000 - 110,000 Tutor/Demonstrator 59,000 - 64,000

Table 6: Myanmar Public Sector Academic Salaries, by Rank⁹⁰

97. Private sector salaries, by comparison, are normally set at between double and triple those at public sector HEIs. The problem of 'moonlighting' will not, therefore, be simple to resolve. Raising public-sector salaries to a level where 'moonlighting' is no longer necessary may well prove unaffordable – and raising academic salaries only (as opposed to raising all public-sector salaries) would be politically unsustainable. The situation is, therefore, delicate, but attention does need to be given to raising academic salaries.

E. Quality and Relevance

98. This section of the report addresses urgent priorities and reform issues in the higher education subsector regarding quality and relevance. It also seeks to develop relevant recommendations for areas requiring in-depth sector analysis during the CESR's second phase. Table 7 presents an overview of the contents of this section.

Table 7: Overview for Quality and Relevance

Priority Areas	Issues	Recommendations
Teaching quality	Though all new academic staff members	Develop a model suitable to conditions in

⁸⁷ See also ADB. 2012. Shadow Education: Private Supplementary Tutoring and its Implications for Policy Makers in Asia. Manila

⁸⁸ This can also have implications for accurate staffing numbers, with some private HEIs claiming full-time status for part-time lecturers, already employed full time at a public HEI.

⁸⁹ Ford (2013) 'Cambodian Higher Education' (Op. Cit), p. 15.

⁹⁰ Base salaries increase by 2000 kyats every 2 years, within the range. Salaries for all public sector employees, including in education, were increased by 30,000 kyats (US\$35) in April 2012.

and methods	at MoE universities must now attend a two-month centrally provided induction program, most university lecturers have had no formal training in teaching, and their teaching practices are mainly teacher-centred and examinations-based. There are few opportunities for students to provide feedback on the quality of their learning experiences, and teaching practices do not encourage students to be self-managing in their approach to learning. The importance of examinations encourages copying and related forms of academic dishonesty.	Myanmar whereby all HEIs establish teaching and learning support centres, with specially-qualified staff members whose role is to promote more learner-centred approaches to teaching and a greater variety of student assessment approaches. Staff members from these centres should also routinely conduct training programs for all lecturing staff. These initiatives should be developed within a national QA framework that addresses the quality of teaching and of training programs, and that also addresses issues related to financial transparency.
Research	The responsibility of universities to conduct research is not well defined, and there are at present no incentives for lecturers to conduct research. Centres of research excellence are developing, but these are still not well benchmarked against international standards, and funding arrangements for them are unclear. Research is not monitored from the perspective of its community benefit. Protections for the quality of PhD education are limited.	Provide capacity-building support to develop a national policy on research and innovation, giving particular attention to the role and importance of research conducted by universities, its funding, and the need for funded research to demonstrate benefits for the people of Myanmar. Provide support to develop and evaluate pilot scheme in some stronger HEIs whereby academic staff are rewarded financially for publications. The scheme should be linked to the provision of training in research methods, and perhaps mentoring in writing for publication, and would also need to be monitored for transparency. In the interests of equity and the full development of human resources, particular attention should be paid to the needs of HEIs in rural and minority locations in any wider rollout of the scheme. Model costs of a modest national research scheme.
Curriculum and syllabus	The curriculum is not routinely revised and updated, and it is not well informed by international content, models and standards. Students are not routinely required to develop and demonstrate independent problem-solving skills, nor are they generally required to apply knowledge to solve practical problems. The effectiveness of the curriculum in preparing graduates for employment is not systematically evaluated.	Provide capacity-building support to enable national disciplinary experts to develop curriculum frameworks that promote active learning by requiring problem-solving skills, the application of knowledge to solve practical problems, and the integration of workplace-based learning with the more conceptually-based learning of the university classroom.
Graduate quality	Recent graduates are not 'employment- ready', that is, they need to learn skills in applying knowledge, communicating with colleagues and customers, time management, problem-solving, and so on. Many appear not to have developed a strong 'work ethic' during their undergraduate studies.	Implement a survey of employers to obtain objective data on their perceptions of graduate quality, and, in light of the results, develop options for changes if required to the ways in which students are taught and assessed.
Internationalisation	Myanmar's opening, after decades of isolation, presents both challenges and opportunities, with a key economic priority being to re-engage the international community and draw on its experience in the service of national development. There are key sources of international interest and support that could materially support the strengthening of Myanmar's higher education, as well as pointing to some of the challenges of managing this upsurge of interest, and support. The key	Capacity-building assistance should be provided to develop an overall map/matrix of projects, donors, agendas and proposed outcomes, with a view to enhancing both overall coordination of support for the higher education sector, as well as to boost support for internal capacity development, such as training in project management, financial and other administration, and research skills. Such capacity development should be linked to transparency training. A 'single entry door' should be seriously considered for any international donor projects, and care taken to

	challenges are of limited local capacity, enhancing system coordination, eliminating wasteful duplication, and developing a coherent framework for the development of higher education in Myanmar, to which external support should contribute. Given estimates that external support is likely to almost double within years, these challenges should not be taken lightly.	ensure that all projects relate to Myanmar national development goals, (in education).
(Re-deploying) Myanmar's Knowledge Diaspora.	A significant level of higher-level human resources have left Myanmar, often to work in other ASEAN member states, resulting in both a major and ongoing loss of talent, and significant educational inefficiency, since these individuals are the most expensive to produce.	A review should be conducted of the experience of regional countries that have implemented such foreign talent/knowledge diaspora schemes, notably the PRC, as well as the costs and benefits of financing such a model scheme. The aim should be to draw lessons that might be adapted for use in the Myanmar context.
Information management	Information sharing between HEIs and across the subsector is generally deficient, which greatly restricts strategic planning aimed at securing national priorities in teaching and research.	Capacity-building assistance should be provided to enable the higher education subsector to collect and analyse data related to the attainment of strategic goals and objectives for the subsector. Model HEMIS?

99. Teaching Quality and Methods. There is widespread agreement in Myanmar that teaching quality and teaching methods need improvement. Against a background of very restricted resource availability, teacher-centred approaches reliant mainly on information dissemination are commonly adopted, and the examination is the dominant mode of student assessment. In this regard, little has changed since 1992 when U Saw Gibson and U Thien Hay recorded that: "An academic-year-end examination is held annually and marks scored in each subject are taken as indicators of the student's academic performance. In some academic disciplines, tutorial and laboratory works done throughout the year are taken into account in the final assessment, the allocation to this mode being about 20 per cent of the total."91 Student-centred approaches to learning have been widely encouraged, even by the President of Myanmar, who in a visit to Mawlamyine University in mid-December 2012 endorsed their importance.⁹² The adoption of student-centred approaches to teaching will, however, require more resources, particularly more opportunities for Internet access, more freedom of access to Internet resources and more library resources. It will also require the provision of extensive retraining opportunities for academic staff, few of whom have had any formal induction to student-centred teaching methods, and most of whom model their teaching practices on the example provided by their lecturers, most of whom were teachercentred in their approach to teaching.

100. A recent initiative whereby all new lecturers appointed to MoE universities and institutes must attend a two-month induction program will over time have a positive impact on the quality of teaching in these HEIs, but it is a small step in the face of what is a big problem. All lecturing staff across the subsector should be provided with opportunities to explore and apply different forms of teaching and student assessment. Existing approaches to student assessment are reported to stressful for students and lecturers alike. It is also reported anecdotally that students faced with the pressure of end-of-year examinations are often inclined to resort to various forms of academic dishonesty, and that lecturers feel pressured to achieve high pass rates, thereby detracting from their independence of judgement about the quality of student performance.

101. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase a model suitable to conditions in Myanmar should be developed whereby all HEIs establish teaching and

_

⁹¹ Footnote 2. p.10.

⁹² New Light of Myanmar, 2012. President Visits University. 16 December.

learning support centres with specially-qualified staff members whose role is to promote more learner-centred approaches to teaching and a greater variety of student assessment approaches. It is also recommended that staff members from these centres should routinely conduct training programs for all lecturing staff, and that these initiatives should be developed within a national QA framework that addresses the quality of teaching and of training programs as well as issues related to financial transparency.

- 102. **Research**. As noted earlier, the responsibility of universities to conduct research is not well defined, and there are at present no incentives for lecturers to conduct research. Centres of research excellence are developing, but these are still not well benchmarked against international standards, and funding arrangements for them are unclear. Research is not monitored from the perspective of its community benefit. Research is inadequately supported, and not considered as a criterion for academic staff performance review and promotion. There is an almost complete absence of a research culture across the higher education system. Protections for the quality of PhD education are limited.
- 103. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be capacity-building support provided for the development of a national policy on research and innovation, giving particular attention to the role and importance of research conducted by universities, its funding, and the need for funded research to demonstrate benefits for the people of Myanmar. It is also recommended that a 'two birds, one stone' approach to rebuilding a research culture might be trialled in the form of a pilot scheme in some of the stronger HEIs whereby academic staff are rewarded financially for publications. The scheme should be linked to the provision of training in research methods, and perhaps some mentoring in writing for publication, and would also need to be monitored for transparency. In the interests of equity and the full development of human resources, particular attention should also be paid to the needs of HEIs in rural and minority locations in any wider rollout of the scheme.
- 104. **Curriculum and Syllabus**. There is widespread agreement that the curriculum across most HEIs is not routinely revised and updated, and is not well informed by international content, models and standards. Students are not routinely required to develop and demonstrate independent problem-solving skills, nor are they generally required to develop skills in applying knowledge to solve practical problems. Feedback from students on their experience of the curriculum is not routinely collected, and neither is there any opportunity for employers and industry leaders to contribute to curriculum development. A practice widely adopted in other higher education systems is to arrange for undergraduates to obtain professional experience in the workplace as a component part of their training programs, but this practice does not appear to be adopted in most HEIs in Myanmar.
- 105. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase capacity-building support should be provided to enable national disciplinary experts to develop curriculum frameworks that promote active learning by requiring problem-solving skills, the application of knowledge to solve practical problems, and the integration of workplace-based learning with the more conceptually-based learning of the university classroom.
- 106. **Graduate Quality**. Information about graduate quality in Myanmar does not seem ever to have been collected, and the views of employers about the quality of graduates have never been systematically obtained. Discussion with representatives of the business community suggest that employers of recent graduates find that the graduates still need to be taught skills in applying knowledge, communicating with colleagues and customers, time management, problem-solving, and so on. There is also a view that recent graduates may not have acquired a sufficiently strong 'work ethic' during their undergraduate studies. This

-

⁹³ Footnote 30, p. 98.

claim is difficult to test, but university lecturers report that they are expected to achieve high pass rates in examinations – indeed, their performance as lecturers is assessed on this basis. There is, therefore, a situation in which lecturers can be made to feel that they bear much of the responsibility for securing high pass rates, thus lessening the pressure on students to apply themselves conscientiously to their studies. Indeed, some university lecturers report that their students feel very little pressure to focus on their studies. The main pressure felt is at the point of completing of the matriculation examination, for which the pass rate routinely appears to be about 30%. Pass rates in HEIs are much higher, though data now being collected as part of the CESR project indicate some wide variations between HEIs.

- 107. It is recommended that, during the CESR's second phase, capacity-building support should be provided to *implement of a survey of employers to obtain objective data on their perceptions of graduate quality, and, in light of the results, to develop options for changes if required to the ways in which students are taught and assessed.*
- 108. **Internationalisation.** Myanmar's opening, after decades of isolation, presents both challenges and opportunities, with a key economic priority being to re-engage the international community and draw on its experience in the service of national development. Until recently, for example, foreigners were not allowed to enter HEIs: "For the past 50 years, we had a closed door policy". Now the situation is easier, although site visits were still something of a challenge for Phase 1. The changing landscape of higher education, particularly within the dynamic and diverse ASEAN region, is becoming "more internationalised, cross-cultural, cross-bordered and further engaged with job markets and economic growth." There are key sources of international interest and support that could materially support the strengthening of Myanmar's higher education, as well as real challenges in managing this upsurge of interest, and support. The key challenges are limited local capacity, enhancing system coordination, eliminating wasteful duplication, and developing a coherent framework for the development of higher education in Myanmar, to which external support should contribute. Given estimates that external support is likely to almost double within years, these challenges should not be taken lightly.
- 109. Given Myanmar's stated goal of initially moving towards ASEAN standards in its education system, including in higher education, ASEAN's moves to support Myanmar, individually and collectively, are of particular importance. Even during the period of EU and US sanctions, ASEAN's pattern was of 'constructive engagement' and non-interference, and the 'ASEAN Way' was characterised by quiet diplomacy and informal agreements. As early as the *Nusa Dua* ASEAN meeting in November 2011, endorsement was reached to award Myanmar the Chair in 2014, while the hosting of the SE Asian Games in December 2013 will help further Myanmar's regional integration to an extent. Significantly, the establishment of the ASEAN Economic Area from 2015 includes moves to harmonise regional higher education systems, although patience will be needed to integrate the Myanmar system.
- 110. The Economic Research Institute for ASEAN and East Asia (ERIA) is also working with Nay Pyi Thaw to develop a comprehensive economic development plan, and narrow development gaps. Thailand is the second largest investor in Myanmar, with Singapore's

_

⁹⁴ Science, (2012). 'Raising Up a Fallen Ivory Tower' 338, November 30th., Pp. 1140-1142.

⁹⁵ SEAMEO RIHED (n.d.) 'SEAMEO RIHED and the MIT (Malaysia-Indonesia-Thailand) Student Mobility Pilot Program – Towards the Harmonisation of Higher Education.' See http://www.rihed.seameo.org/mambo/files/harmonizMIT2.pdf
⁹⁶ The same lack of capacity to manage capital budget increases has been made by the World Bank analysis of

The same lack of capacity to manage capital budget increases has been made by the World Bank analysis of Myanmar's education finance system, see World Bank (2013) Rapid Assessment ... p. 35, and was also openly acknowledged as a challenge by President U Thein Sein, "President U Thein Sein delivers an Address.." (Op. Cit).

97 See, for example, Mya Than. 2005. Myanmar in ASEAN. Regional Cooperation Experience. Singapore, ISEAS.

⁹⁸ Reuters. 2011. ASEAN Gambles on Myanmar's Regional Leadership. 16 November.

⁹⁹ The Nation. 2012. ASEAN's ERIA to help Myanmar. 19 November.

bi-lateral trade having doubled from US\$1.2 billion to US\$2.4 billion from 2007-08 to 2011-12, including significant investment in hospitality and services. Of Myanmar's research links, the top give are all ASEAN – Singapore, Thailand, Brunei, Indonesia, and Philippines in descending order. The planned ASEAN Credit Transfer System, that is said to come into effect in 2013, and which is designed both to ease student mobility within the sub-region, and boost the quantity and quality of human resources, may well include selected Myanmar HEIs within the initial pilot scheme. The Malaysia Indonesia Thailand (MIT) Project may be a model that could be extended to other ASEAN member states, over time, including Myanmar. Credit transfer, however, is at different stages of development among the various ASEAN member states, and thus far, "... credit transfer is at an early stage in Myanmar, and students can only move within the country, rather than abroad."

- 111. APEC leaders, too, are calling for greater cross-border cooperation, as a step towards the creation of an Asia-Pacific higher education space, including ASEAN + 9. The recent Vladivostok communiqué called for enhanced "mobility of students, researchers and education providers within APEC, through the development of higher education cooperation." Predictably, perhaps, this was set within a general Knowledge Economy framework, with an emphasis on links between higher education, and the growth of innovation and knowledge intensive industries. In each case, system compatibility, inadequate communication between HEIs, and financing, remain key issues to be addressed.
- 112. Of individual ASEAN member states, Brunei's leader, Sultan *Haji Hassanal Bolkiah Muizzaddin Waddaullah* recently promised to lend greater support to Myanmar higher education: "Regarding the Cooperation in Education sector, he vowed to increase the number of scholarships for Myanmar citizens'. In return, President U Thein Sein, during his visit to Brunei, "expressed thanks for seeing Myanmar students taking courses in Brunei University. He also expressed thanks for a programme that allowed staff of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to have a joint training that would benefit them in dealing with matters while Myanmar takes the chair of ASEAN." The Ministry of Education, Singapore, also offers ASEAN scholarships that lead to the award of GCE A-Level qualifications, and also offered undergraduate scholarships, tenable at one of Singapore's three universities. Sponsored by Norway, and Sweden, 40 qualified Myanmar Masters candidates were to be awarded

¹⁰⁰ International Enterprise Singapore. 2012. Myanmar. p. 9.

¹⁰¹ European Union. SEA SEA-EU. Country Profile. MM – Myanmar (Third Countries group). See http://www.sea-eu.net/attach/MM Country Profiles 20120727.pdf

¹⁰³ University World News. 2012. Building Asia's Platform for Student Mobility. 2 December. Given ASEAN's reputation for rhetoric to outstrip action, this move will need to be closely monitored. See e.g. A. Welch. 2012. Regionalism and the Limits of Regionalism in Indonesian Higher Education. In D. Neubauer and J. Hawkins, eds. Regionalism in East Asian Higher Education. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

¹⁰⁴ The economic dimension was also listed, with the claim that the Education component of APEC economies accounts for almost 7% of GDP. See University World News. 2012. APEC Summit Moves Towards Asia Pacific Higher Education Space. 13 September. For more on the state of Asia-Pacific Mobility, see D. Neubauer and K. Kuroda, eds. 2012. *Mobility and Migration in Asia Pacific Higher Education*. London.: Palgrave Macmillan.

Kuroda, eds. 2012. *Mobility and Migration in Asia Pacific Higher Education*. London,: Palgrave Macmillan.

105 New Light of Myanmar. 2012. Myanmar, Brunei focus on Strengthening Bilateral Relations, Further Cooperation on Mutually Beneficial Basis in Future. 6 December. Underlining the trend of highly qualified Myanmar graduates to leave and work in neighbouring states, the Sultan "expressed thanks for contribution of academicians, intellectuals and intelligentsia, medics, nurses...from Myanmar toward development of Brunei."

106 Ministry of Education, Singapore. ASEAN Scholarships for Myanmar. See

http://www.moe.gov.sg/education/scholarships/asean/myanmar/ and Singapore Government, Singapore Government Scholarships for South East Asians. Myanmar candidates had to have completed at least 1st year or 2nd year of undergraduate studies in a local Myanmar university. See

http://www.scholars4dev.com/2438/singapore-scholarships-for-southeast-asians/#ixzz2GVyDmdTb

40

eu.net/attacn/MM Country Profiles 20120727.pgi

102 See, for more, SEAMEO RIHED (n.d.) SEAMEO RIHED and the MIT (Malaysia-Indonesia-Thailand) Student Mobility Pilot Program – Towards the Harmonisation of Higher Education. See http://www.rihed.seameo.org/mambo/files/harmonizMIT2.pdf and SEAMEO RIHED (2011). Second MIT Student Mobility Review Meeting, Bali, September. http://www.rihed.seameo.org/mambo/2011/overview.pdf

places in Bangkok's Asian Institute of Technology, for three years from August 2012. Bridging courses were also available, if needed. 107

- 113. Of International Agencies, the World Bank is beginning the process of re-engagement with Myanmar, after not having offered any loans since 1987. It is now offering US\$85 million for community development projects that can include education. As part of its interim strategy for Myanmar, "The Bank is also expanding technical assistance and providing global expertise to help the government deliver services to the people. The Bank is now conducting economic research in Myanmar to gain a better understanding of the extent of poverty, to help expand and modernize the financial system, improve budget systems, and enhance the business environment." The Asian Development Bank (ADB) is also expanding its involvement and assistance, including via the substantial CESR project, the first such review since 1992. UNICEF, UNESCO, and numerous other agencies, such as JICA are also substantially involved in higher education partnerships.
- 114. Sixty years ago, after the end of British rule, dozens of Burmese students were sent to MIT for graduate studies, returning to become Assistant Professors at what was then Rangoon Technical University (later YTU). At much the same time, Johns Hopkins University established the Rangoon-Hopkins Centre for South East Asian Studies at Rangoon University. 109 Current US re-engagement with Myanmar involves USAID partnerships that "support the US-Burma commitment to Democracy, Peace and Prosperity" and promotes PPPs as a business model. 110 In practice this means partnerships between universities (both US and Myanmar) and business. Relevant organisations include private businesses, business and trade associations, foundations, non-governmental organisations, faith-based organizations, U.S.-based international organizations, state and community colleges and universities, civic groups, and regional organizations. USAID support already enables Myanmar students to gain an associate degree from Indiana University. The State Department coordinates the US-ASEAN Innovation in Science through Partners in Regional Engagement (INSPIRE) Initiative, and cooperates with USAID on the Partnerships for Enhanced Engagement in Research (PEER) program. 111
- 115. A further major US initiative consists of the International Academic Partnership Program (IAPP) with Myanmar, coordinated by the Institute for International Education (IIE). It adopts a multi-pronged approach aimed at helping each of 9 selected US HEIs, each with some Myanmar experience, to build partnerships with institutions in Myanmar, and help the country rebuild its higher education capacity. IIE will bring representative of 9 US HEIs to Myanmar in February, 2013, to both lecture on topics such as accreditation, quality assurance, faculty development, student learning, partnerships, and engage in dialogue with Myanmar HEIs about their needs and priorities. Johns Hopkins is already supporting the teaching of Law and Political Science at Yangon University. According to IIE data, a total of 796 Myanmar students studied in the U.S. in the academic year 2010/11, a 14.5% increase from the previous year. Fewer than 100 U.S. students had studied abroad in Myanmar in 2009/10.

FundsForNGOs. Higher education partnership to support the US-Burma commitment to Democracy, Peace & Prosperity- USAID/Burma. See

http://www.fundsforngos.org/myanmar/higher-education-partnership-support-usburma-commitment-democracy-peace-prosperity-usaidburma/#ixzz2GWCFoBdq

Asian Institute for Technology. Scholarships for Myanmar Nationals. See
http://203.159.12.32:8082/AIT/admissions/Current_Scholarships/norway-and-sida-scholarships-for-myanmar-nationals

World Bank. 2012. Myanmar Overview. See http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/myanmar/overview

¹⁰⁹ Science 2012. p. 1141

¹¹¹ US Department of State 2012. The US-ASEAN INSPIRE Initiative. See http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2012/11/200822.htm

- 116. EU support for higher education includes support for research, via the South East Asia EU (sea-eu) program in which applications from Myanmar have met with significant success. While only a handful of applications were fielded by Myanmar, the success rate was much higher than third-country average: 40%, compared to the average of 23.7%. This was 17th among all third-country success rates, however still ranked only 111th in number of participations, and 119th, in terms of budget share, of all third-countries within the program. Most recently, Myanmar was added to the Netherlands Fellowship Programmes (NFP) country list, which means that applicants from Myanmar became eligible for NFP Fellowships (either short courses, Masters or Ph. D.). 113
- 117. The UK has also announced support for the support of Myanmar Higher Education subsector. According to the British Council in June 2012, "Plans are afoot in tertiary education aimed at strengthening higher education institutions... "We hope to provide support and opportunities for academic mobility and develop research and teaching links between academics and students in our two countries." The plan is said to include both postgraduate training for academics, and institutional management and leadership. 114 Language training has also been mentioned as a priority.
- Canada's IDRC is supporting a rapid appraisal to assess current capacity and identify priority capacity development needs of Universities or Ministries' public research institutes. The research institutes sampled will cover IDRC thematic interests, namely economics, public health, agriculture, environmental studies, and communication. The assessment was to identify programming opportunities for IDRC and possible modalities. The assessment included both a literature review of Myanmar's institutional and organisational arrangements for development research in higher education and for policy purposes, and small sample of selected institutions via interviews with institute directors and others, site visits, a review of research output of recent years, assessment of prospects and challenges of institutes' current research priorities and demand. As well, interviews with development partners involved with the higher education and research sector to discuss current and future plans for support, partnership and capacity development were planned. The outcome was to be a concise synthesis report on (i) institutional and organisational arrangements and prospects. (ii) current capacity, programs and challenges of research organisations sampled, (iii) prospects of future investment by the Myanmar government in human and facility development, (iv) activities and plans of international partners in support of Myanmar's development research capacity, (v) strategic windows of opportunity for IDRC investment; and (vi) recommendations on potential organisational partnering arrangements for implementation of possible IDRC supported capacity-development activities. IDRC supports development research and had already funded a peer exchange between CDRI and MDRI when MDRI was being established, and a research scholarship program at Chiang Mai University entitled "Exploring Myanmar's development", designed to build the capacity of Myanmar junior and mid-level researchers to conduct development analysis and research.115
- 119. Korea has promised to build a Myanmar Development Institute, based on the Korean namesake, to provide economic analysis and research. India has promised to develop an Internet Open University in Sagaing at the Institute of Development of Nationalities. Mandalay University has reached agreement to partner with University Lyons 2 and University Montpellier 2 from France, and Pathein University with French University Montpellier 2, the latter in bio-science research.

http://www.nuffic.nl/en/news/latest-news/burma-myanmar-added-to-nfp-country-list

115 See http://mrf-fellowships.weebly.com/

¹¹² European Union. SEA SEA SEA-EU. Country Profile. MM – Myanmar (Third Countries group). See http://www.sea-eu.net/attach/MM Country Profiles 20120727.pdf

NUFFIC. Burma/Myanmar added to NFP country list. See

¹¹⁴ UWN 2012c 'International Help to upgrade Burma's neglected University Sector', June 25th

- 120. Chinese assessments of the special nature of the Chinese Myanmar relationship, often deploying the term 'Pauk Paw' to signify the fraternal nature of bi-lateral relations, have been tested recently, both by the recent decision to suspend work on the Chinese-backed Myitsone Hydropower Project, and by the US pivot towards Asia. Nonetheless, as with other ASEAN member states, the PRC has been a generous sponsor of scholarships for Myanmar scholars to study at Chinese universities. Official pronouncements on both sides, stress harmonious development and strengthened relationships. Attending the recent China-ASEAN Business Investment Summit in Nanning, PRC, in September 2012, Myanmar's President, U Thein Sein, said, "As our economies are connected to each other, we are happy to see a healthy economy growing in China."
- 121. Japan is supporting the introduction of more child-centred pedagogy in Myanmar, as well as contributing substantially to the analysis of the system, including the university sector. The Human Resource Development Scholarship Phase II is being finalized and implemented. In terms of humanitarian cooperation, Japan has sponsored the most international students and trainees through official programs; many cabinet members and department directors of the new administration have been exchange students in Japan, from a time when many Myanmar students were still sent to Japan for further study, and were sponsored by either Monbusho, or a private non-profit Japanese foundation. The Science Council of Japan is also supportive of ideas for joint research. ¹¹⁶ Finance Minister Taro Aso visited in early January 2013, in an effort to "tap a market of 64 million people that has been dominated by China", although reports of his visit did not allude to higher education initiatives. ¹¹⁷
- 122. Australia recently announced a substantial increase in the number of scholarships to students from Myanmar, from 20 to 50 by 2015 (as well as supporting improved quality in monastic schools, providing textbooks to 1.1 million children and provide meals for 1.3 million schoolchildren). Overall, the commitment totals A\$80 million (about US\$80 million), with support for the education sector largely via the Multi-Donor Education Fund (MDEF). MDEF funding supported Phase 1 of the CESR.
- 123. The Open Society Foundations (OSF) is already significantly invested in Myanmar higher education reform. It is working closely with the Myanmar Academy of Arts and Sciences; a joint Roundtable discussion was hosted in late June at the Academy, and the OSF, as part of its aim to support capacity development in Higher Education, is already supporting short-term Visiting Scholar appointments in Myanmar. As well, a three-day programme, partnered by Yangon University and OSI, designed to boost understanding, and applicability, of social research methods, was held in late November. The workshop, which included some interactive elements, employed a number of invited guests, from several countries, giving lectures on a range of topics, including why do research, and specific research methods.
- 124. Overall, the plethora of programs, projects and prospects, by different agencies, donors and states, has led to some confusion, as has been acknowledged by more than one source: "The [MDEF] fund also suffered from a lack of adequate coordination between donors (AusAID, the UK's Department for International Development, European Union, Norway and Denmark) and UNICEF, which sometimes left donors unclear on program progress and unable to bring about improvement in a timely manner. While coordination improved in 2011 compared to previous years, there was a consensus among donors that

_

¹¹⁶ Myanmar Academy of Arts and Sciences. 2012. *Annual Newsletter*. October.

¹¹⁷ The Nation. 2013. Japan's Finance Minister Taro Aso Targets Myanmar markets amid China Rivalry. 4 January.

more thorough and responsive program governance arrangements would be required for MDEF II."118

- 125. International experience indicates this outcome is not unique. Capacity development has also been hampered until recently by EU and Sanctions. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be the development of an overall map/matrix of projects, donors, agendas and proposed outcomes, with a view to enhancing both overall coordination of support for the higher education sector, as well as to boost support for internal capacity development, such as training in project management, financial and other administration, and research skills. Such capacity development should be linked to transparency training.
- (Re-deploying) Myanmar's Knowledge Diaspora. A significant level of higher-level human resources have left Myanmar, often to work in other ASEAN member states, resulting in both a major and ongoing loss of talent, and significant educational inefficiency, since these individuals are the most expensive to produce. UIS Global Education Digest 2012 reports that in 2010, 6,288 Myanmar students were enrolled abroad. The top 5 destinations were, in descending order, the Russian Federation (1,627), Thailand (1,205), Japan (1,011), U.S.A. (689), Australia (590). 119 Numbers sent abroad for study seem modest: "In 2011, 136 scholars were sent abroad: 9 scholars of Ph. D., 3 for research, 36 for training courses, 9 for study tour, and 79 for attending seminars and workshops" 120 There have always been some who have been willing to return and contribute their expertise, notwithstanding the difficulties: 'Sayama' for example, after completing her PhD in medical research, on a government scholarship, at London's Royal Postgraduate Medical School in 1990, felt compelled to return, despite a claustrophobic academic atmosphere fostered by the Junta, that disdained foreign ideas, and frowned on speaking in English. In addition, she faced the resentment of local colleagues, who had not had her opportunities for foreign study, and did not want "some hifaluting person telling them what to do."121 The pattern of resentment, and/or a perception that the returnee is no longer a genuine local, but had been corrupted by 'western' ideas, has been found in several other regional systems, particularly in East Asia (Japan, Korea).
- 127. Table 8 gives an idea of the loss of Myanmar trained workers to neighbouring countries. While it does not distinguish those with higher education, anecdotal evidence suggests that significant numbers of those from Myanmar with at least some level of higher education are working in neighbouring countries, often at skill levels well below that which might be expected by their level of formal qualification.

Table 8: Numbers of Myanmar workers, Working in Neighbouring Countries, 2012¹²²

Country	Numbers Officially Registered	Estimates of Real Numbers
Thailand	1,450,000	2,000,000 - 4,000,000
Malaysia	150,000	Up to 500,000
Singapore	-	100,000 – 200,000
Japan	8,577	7,000 -15,000

¹¹⁸ AusAID. 2012. Burma Annual Program Performance Report 2011.

¹²¹ Science. 2012. p. 1141.

http://www.ausaid.gov.au/countries/eastasia/myanmar/Documents/burma-appr-2011.pdf

¹¹⁹ UIS 2012. *Global Education Digest 2012*, p. 135.

¹²⁰ Footnote 48, p. 13.

¹²² MM Win and U Naing, (2012). *Job Creation and Skill Development by Border Area Development between Myanmar and Thailand* 2012. Powerpoint presentation, ILO/JICA workshop, *Skills Development in the Thai-Myanmar Border Areas*. Yangon, 29 November.

Korea	6,309	4,000 – 10,000
PRC, India, Indonesia	N/A	N/A

- 128. At the same time, Myanmar's increasing openness, and solid economic growth rates offer new opportunities to draw back overseas scholars to contribute to scholarship, teaching and national development priorities. Korea and Taipei, China were among the earlier successes in developing incentive schemes to recruit expatriate intellectuals to the service of national development. More recently, the PRC has developed at least a dozen major schemes to deploy their substantial knowledge diaspora, even on a part-time basis. The potential for Viet Nam has also been articulated recently, notwithstanding some political difficulties. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase a review should be conducted of the experience of regional countries that have implemented such foreign talent/knowledge diaspora schemes, notably the PRC, as well as the costs and benefits of financing such a model scheme. The aim should be to draw lessons that might be adapted for use in the Myanmar context.
- 129. **Information Management**. A significant problem affecting policy development in the higher education subsector is that there is insufficient data available about a great many aspects of the subsector. Compounding the problem is the tendency for information not to be shared between HEIs, or between relevant Ministries. Strategic planning for the subsector is therefore very difficult. Strategic plans typically involve articulating a vision, setting goals and objectives, establishing processes for achieving the goals and objectives, assembling the resources necessary to implement the processes, and implementing information management mechanisms that provide timely and reliable data on progress towards the attainment of intended goals.
- 130. To date, it is not evident that the higher education subsector has available to it the information management mechanisms required to determine if intended goals are being achieved. The targets identified in the National Education Development Plan of September 2012 lend themselves well to having progress towards their attainment monitored. With current information management mechanisms in the higher education subsector, however, it would be difficult to measure progress over time towards the attainment of these targets.
- 131. It is recommended that during the CESR's second phase there should be capacity-building assistance provided to enable the higher education subsector to develop a model for the collection and analysis of data related to the attainment of strategic goals and objectives for the subsector. HEMIS?

F. Concluding Remarks

132. This report has addressed a range of key priority and reform issues concerning policy, legislation and management, access and equity, and quality and relevance in relation to the higher education subsector in Myanmar. A focus of the chapter has been upon laying the groundwork and making recommendations for the CESR's second phase, in which there will be an in-depth sector analysis that is large scale and participatory in approach, and that incorporates more focused investigations and capacity building. The report has drawn attention to many gaps in knowledge about the higher education subsector in Myanmar.

¹²³ See A. Welch and H-X Cai, 2010. Enter the Dragon: the Internationalisation of Chinese Higher Education. In J. Ryan, J. (ed.) *China's Higher Education Reform and Internationalisation*. London: Routledge. H-X Cai and A. Welch. 2010. The Chinese Knowledge Diaspora in the Development of Chinese Research Universities: a Case Study of the 111 Project. *Washington, World Bank, (Diaspora forum)*. F. Simon and C. Cao. 2009. *China's Emerging Technological Edge. Assessing the Role of High End Talent.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

¹²⁴ A. Welch. 2010. The Internationalisation of Vietnamese higher Education; Retrospect and Prospect. In G. Harman, M. Hayden and P.T. Nghi, eds. *Reforming Vietnam's Higher Education*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Where possible, it has also sought to address these gaps by integrating existing data with a view to providing a firmer foundation for more detailed investigations, and reforms.

Appendix 1
Universities, Degree Colleges and Colleges in Higher Education (2012)

Sr.No	Region	University/Degree College/College	Ministry
1	Kachin	Myitkyina University	MoE
2		Mohnyin Degree College	MoE
3		Myitkyina Institute of Education	MoE
4		Technological University (Myitkyina)	MoST
5		Technological College (Mohnyin)	MoST
6		University of Computer Studies	MoST
7		(Myitkyina) Bamaw University	MoE
8		Technological University (Bamaw)	MoST
9		University of Computer Studies (Bamaw)	MoST
10	Kayar	Loikaw University	MoE
11		Technological University (Loikaw)	MoST
12		University of Computer Studies (Loikaw)	MoST
13	Kayin	Pha-An University	MoE
14		Pha-An Institute of Education	MoE
15		Technological University (Pha-An)	MoST
16		University of Computer Studies (Pha-An)	MoST
17	Chin	Kalay University	MoE
18		Technological University (Kalay)	MoST
19		University of Computer Studies (Kalay)	MoST
20	Mon	Mawlamyine University	MoE
21		Mawlamyine Institute of Education	MoE
22		Technological University (Mawlamyine)	MoST
23		University of Computer Studies (Mawlamyine)	MoST
24	Rakhine	Sittway University	MoE
25		Taunggok College	MoE
26		Kyauk Phyu Education College	MoE
27		Technological University (Sittway)	MoST
28		University of Computer Studies	MoST
29	Sagaing	(Sittway) Sagaing Institute of Education	MoE
30		Monywar University	MoE

31		Monywar Institute of Economics	MoE
32		Shwe Bo University	MoE
33		Sagaing University	MoE
34		Sagaing Education College	MoE
35		Monywar Education College	MoE
36	_	Technological University (Monywar)	MoST
37	_	Technological College (Shwe Bo)	MoST
38	_	Technological University (Sagaing)	MoST
39	_	University of Computer Studies	MoST
40		(Monywar) University of Cooperatives (Sagaing)	МоСо
41		University for Development of National	UCS
42	Tanintharyi	Races Dawei University	MoE
43		Dawei Education College	MoE
44	_	Technological University (Dawei)	MoST
45		University of Computer Studies (Dawei)	MoST
46	_	Meik University	MoE
47	_	Technological University (Meik)	MoST
48		University of Computer Studies (Meik)	MoST
49	Bago	Taungoo University	MoE
50		Bago University	MoE
51	_	Taungoo Education College	MoE
52	_	Technological University (Taungoo)	MoST
53	_	University of Computer Studies	MoST
		(Taungoo)	
54		Pyay University	MoE
55		Pyay Education College	MoE
56		Technological University (Pyay)	MoST
57		University of Computer Studies (Pyay)	MoST
58	Magway	Magway University	MoE
59	\neg	Yenanchaung Degree College	MoE
60	\dashv	Magway Education College	MoE
61	\dashv	University of Medicine (Magway)	МоН
62		University of Community Health	МоН
63		(Magway) Technological University (Magway)	MoST
64		University of Computer Studies	MoST
65		(Magway) Pakokku University	MoE

66		Pakokku Education College	MoE
67		Technological University (Pakokku)	MoST
68		University of Computer Studies (Pakokku)	MoST
69	Mandalay	Mandalay University	MoE
70		Mandalay University of Foreign	MoE
71		Languages Mandalay University of Distance	MoE
72		Education Yadanarbon University	MoE
73		Myingyan Degree College	MoE
74		Mandalay Education College	MoE
75		University of Medicine, Mandalay	МоН
76		University of Dental Medicine, Mandalay	МоН
77		University of Nursing, Mandalay	МоН
78		University of Medical Technology, Mandalay	МоН
79		University of Pharmacy, Mandalay	МоН
80		University of Traditional Medicine,	МоН
81		Mandalay Mandalay Technological University	MoST
82		Mandalay Computer University	MoST
83		Technological University (Mandalay)	MoST
84		Government Technological College (Myingyan)	MoST
85		University of Computer Studies (Mandalay)	MoST
86		Defence Services Academy	MoD
87		Defence Services Technological Academy	MoD
88		University of Culture (Mandalay)	MoC
89		Co-operative College (Mandalay)	МоСо
90		Myanmar Lacquerware College	MoCo
91		National Youth Resource Development Degree College (Mandalay)	MoBA
92		Technological University (Yadanarbon Cyber City)	MoST
93		Meikhtila University	MoE
94		Meikhtila Institute of Economics	MoE
95		Kyaukse University	MoE
96		Meikhtila Education College	MoE
97		Myanmar Aerospace and Aeronautical Engineering University , Meikhtila	MoST
98		Technological University (Meikhtila)	MoST
99		Technological University (Kyaukse)	MoST
100		University of Computer Studies (Meikhtila)	MoST
101		University of Forestry	MoF

102		Yezin Agricultural University	MoA
103		University of Veterinary Science	MoL&F
104		Technological University (Yamethin)	MoST
105	Yangon	Yangon University	MoE
106		Yangon Institute of Economics	MoE
107		Yangon Institute of Education	MoE
108		Yangon University of Distance Education	MoE
109		Dagon University	MoE
110		Yangon University of Foreign Languages	MoE
111		East Yangon University	MoE
112		West Yangon University	MoE
113		National Management College	MoE
114		Yankin Education College	MoE
115		Hlegu Education College	MoE
116		Thingangyun Education College	MoE
117		University of Medicine (1), Yangon	МоН
118		University of Medicine (2), Yangon	МоН
119		University of Dental Medicine, Yangon	МоН
120		University of Nursing, Yangon	МоН
121		University of Medical Technology,	МоН
122		Yangon University of Pharmacy, Yangon	МоН
123		University of Public Health, Yangon	МоН
124		Yangon Technological University	MoST
125		West Yangon Technological University	MoST
126		University of Computer Studies (Yangon)	MoST
127		Technological University (Thanlyin)	MoST
128		Technological University (Mhawbi)	MoST
129		Defence Services Medical Academy	MoD
130		Military Institute of Nursing and Pharamedical Science	MoD
131		University of Culture (Yangon)	MoC
132		Yangon Co-operative Degree College	МоСо
133		Co-operative College (Phaunggyi)	МоСо
134		International Theravada Buddha Sasana University	MoRA
135		National Youth Resource Development Degree College (Yangon)	MoBA
136		Myanmar Maritime University	MoT
137		Myanmar Maritime Degree College, Yangon	MoT
138	Ayeyarwaddy	Pathein University	MoE

139		Pathein Education College	MoE
140		Myaungmya Education College	MoE
141		Technological University (Pathein)	MoST
142		University of Computer Studies (Pathein)	MoST
143		Hinthada University	MoE
144		Technological University (Hinthada)	MoST
145		University of Computer Studies (Hinthada)	MoST
146		Maubin University	MoE
147		Bokalay Education College	MoE
148		Technological University (Maubin)	MoST
149		University of Computer Studies (Maubin)	MoST
150	Shan	Taunggyi University	MoE
151		Taunggyi Education College	MoE
152		Technological University (Taunggyi)	MoST
153		University of Computer Studies (Taunggyi)	MoST
154		Military Computer and Technological Institute	MoD
155		Pinlon University	MoE
156		Technological University (Pinlon)	MoST
157		University of Computer Studies (Pinlon)	MoST
158		Kyaington University	MoE
159		Technological University (Kyaington)	MoST
160		University of Computer Studies (Kyaington)	MoST
161		Lashio University	MoE
162		Lashio Education College	MoE
163		Technological University (Lashio)	MoST
164		University of Computer Studies (Lashio)	MoST

- MoE Ministry of Education
- MoST Ministry of Education

 MoST Ministry of Science and Technology

 MoH Ministry of Health

 MoD Ministry of Defence

 MoC Ministry of Culture

 MoCo Ministry of Co-operatives

 MoBA Ministry of Border Affairs

- MoRA Ministry of Religious Affairs
- MoT Ministry of Transport
- MoLF Ministry of Livestock and Fishery MoF Ministry of Forestry
- MoA Ministry of Agriculture UCS Union Civil Service

Appendix 2

MYANMAR COMPREHENSIVE EDUCATION SECTOR REVIEW (CESR)

SURVEY OF RECTORS OF HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN MYANMAR

This questionnaire seeks to obtain information about your institution.

This information is important because it will inform the development of policies about future structures and processes for the higher education system.

Please complete the questionnaire as soon as possible and send it by mail or email to the CESR Office. Forwarding details are:

Daw Ohn Mar Thein, Assistant Task Manager Office of Comprehensive Education Sector Review, No 426, Pyay Road, Kamayut Township, Yangon Tel: 2304280, 2304284

Email: cesr.mm@gmail.com

ohnmartheinomt@gmail.com

<u>Confidentiality will be very strictly respected. Individual responses will not be documented in any reports or used for any other purpose than to write a survey report.</u>

1. What is the name of your institution?

2. Please provide the following information about your institution.

Total student enrolment in 2011-12	
Number of students in regular programs in 2011-12	
Number of students in distance education programs in 2011-12	
Number of human resource development programs in 2011-12	
Number of students in human resource development programs in 2011-12	
Number of students in PhD programs in 2011-12	
Number of students in master degree programs in 2011-12	
Number of graduates in 2011	
Number of students in the first-year of regular programs in 2011-12	
Number of applicants for places in the first-year of regular programs in 2011-	
12	
Number of full-time academic staff in 2011-12	
Number of professors and associate professors in 2011-12	
Number of academic staff with PhD qualification in 2011-12	
Number of academic staff with master degree qualifications in 2011-12	
Number of academic staff who are actively engaged in research projects in	
2011-12	
Number of books in Library (please estimate) in 2012	
Number of research publications – national (please estimate) in 2011-12	

Number of research publications – international (please estimate) in 2011-12	
Number of computers in 2011-12	

3. Approximately how much of the income your institution received for 2011-12 comes from each of the following sources? ($Please\ indicate.$)

National Government	%
Provincial Government	%
Business Contracts	%
Research	%
International Cooperation	%
Other (please provide details)	%

4. To what extent do you agree with each of the following statements? (Please circle.)

Statement	Strength of Agreement (please circle)
The way higher education institutions are funded in Myanmar needs to be changed.	(i) Strongly disagree (ii) Disagree (iii) Not sure, or neutral (iv) Agree (v) Strongly agree
The way higher education institutions are governed in Myanmar needs to be changed.	(i) Strongly disagree (ii) Disagree (iii) Not sure, or neutral (iv) Agree (v) Strongly agree
The way that research in higher education institutions in Myanmar is supported needs to be changed.	(i) Strongly disagree(ii) Disagree(iii) Not sure, or neutral(iv) Agree(v) Strongly agree
The way that knowledge is imparted to higher education students in Myanmar needs to be changed.	(i) Strongly disagree (ii) Disagree (iii) Not sure, or neutral (iv) Agree (v) Strongly agree
The way that higher education students are assessed in Myanmar needs to be changed.	(i) Strongly disagree(ii) Disagree(iii) Not sure, or neutral(iv) Agree(v) Strongly agree

5. If you 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed' with any of the statements in the previous question, please indicate below the kinds of changes you would recommend for consideration. (Please respond below, or on additional pages if there is not enough space provided.)